

2005

THE
COMMONWEALTH
LAW REPORTS

CASES DETERMINED
IN THE
HIGH COURT OF AUSTRALIA

EDITOR
J D MERRALLS, AM, QC

VOLUME 224

LAWBOOK CO.

2006

REPORTERS

G J AHERN
M Y BEARMAN
M I BORSKY
G S CLARKE, SC
L G DE FERRARI
C J HORAN
E M KINGSTON
C LYÉ
M K MOSHINSKY
J A REDWOOD
J E RICHARDS
P T VOUT
P G WILLIS

BARRISTERS

PRODUCTION EDITOR

CAROLYN MAY

Published in Sydney by
Lawbook Co.

100 Harris Street, Pyrmont, NSW
160 William Street, Melbourne, Vic
239 George Street, Brisbane, Qld
77 St George's Terrace, Perth, WA

ISSN 0069-7133



© Thomson Legal & Regulatory Limited ABN 64 058 914 668 trading as Lawbook Co.

Typeset by Lawbook Co., Pyrmont, NSW
Printed by Ligare Pty Ltd, Riverwood, NSW

JUSTICES OF THE HIGH COURT OF AUSTRALIA

DURING THE CURRENCY OF THIS VOLUME

THE HONOURABLE ANTHONY MURRAY GLEESON, AC, CHIEF
JUSTICE

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL HUDSON MCHUGH, AC

THE HONOURABLE WILLIAM MONTAGUE CHARLES GUMMOW, AC

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL DONALD KIRBY, AC, CMG

THE HONOURABLE KENNETH MADISON HAYNE, AC

THE HONOURABLE IAN DAVID FRANCIS CALLINAN, AC

THE HONOURABLE JOHN DYSON HEYDON, AC

ATTORNEY-GENERAL

THE HONOURABLE PHILLIP MAXWELL RUDDOCK, MP

**The mode of citation of this volume of
the Commonwealth Law Reports will be as follows:
224 CLR**

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN THIS VOLUME

APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW)	322
Banditt v The Queen	262
BP Australia Pty Ltd; Nader-One Pty Ltd v	656
BP Australia Pty Ltd; Ringrow Pty Ltd v	656
BP Australia Pty Ltd; Ultimate Fuel Pty Ltd v	656
Combet v The Commonwealth	494
Commonwealth, The; Combet v	494
CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic)	98
Customs, Chief Executive Officer of v El Hajje	159
El Hajje; Chief Executive Officer of Customs v	159
Jarratt v Commissioner of Police (NSW)	44
Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment; Stevens v	193
Karingal 2 Holdings Pty Ltd; Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) v	98
Legal Services Commissioner (NSW); APLA Ltd v	322
Mallard v The Queen (2005)	125
Nader-One Pty Ltd v BP Australia Pty Ltd	656
Police (NSW), Commissioner of; Jarratt v	44
R; Banditt v	262
R; Mallard v	125
R; Strong v	1
R; Weiss v	300
Ringrow Pty Ltd v BP Australia Pty Ltd	656
State Revenue (Vic), Commissioner of; CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v	98
State Revenue (Vic), Commissioner of v Karingal 2 Holdings Pty Ltd	98
Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment	193
Strong v The Queen	1
Tambree; Travel Compensation Fund v	627

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

Travel Compensation Fund v Tambree	627
Ultimate Fuel Pty Ltd v BP Australia Pty Ltd	656
Weiss v The Queen	300

TABLE OF CASES JUDICIALLY CONSIDERED IN CASES REPORTED IN THIS VOLUME

<i>AMEV-UDC Finance Ltd v Austin</i> (1986) 162 CLR 170	
Considered. Ringrow Pty Ltd v BP Australia Pty Ltd	656
<i>AMS v AIF</i> (1999) 199 CLR 160	
Applied. APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW)	322
<i>Attorney-General (Vic) v The Commonwealth</i> (1945) 71 CLR 237 at 253	
Referred to. Combet v The Commonwealth	494
<i>Australian Video Retailers Association v Warner Home Video Pty Ltd</i> (2001) 114 FCR 324 at 345	
Approved. Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment	193
<i>Brown v West</i> (1990) 169 CLR 195	
Referred to. Combet v The Commonwealth	494
<i>Charles v Federal Commissioner of Taxation</i> (1954) 90 CLR 598	
Distinguished. CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) ..	98
<i>Cole v Whitfield</i> (1988) 165 CLR 360	
Applied. APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW)	322
<i>Driscoll v The Queen</i> (1977) 137 CLR 517	
Applied. Weiss v The Queen	300
<i>Dunlop Pneumatic Tyre Co Ltd v New Garage & Motor Co Ltd</i> [1915] AC 79 at 86-87	
Applied. Ringrow Pty Ltd v BP Australia Pty Ltd	656
<i>El Hajje v Chief Executive Officer of Customs</i> (2003) 180 FLR 224	
Reversed. Chief Officer of Customs v El Hajje	159
<i>Fleming v The Queen</i> (1998) 197 CLR 250	
Applied. Weiss v The Queen	300
<i>Glenn v Federal Commissioner of Land Tax</i> (1915) 20 CLR 490 at 498	
Applied. CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic)	98
<i>I & L Securities Pty Ltd v HTW Valuers (Brisbane) Pty Ltd</i> (2002) 210 CLR 109	
Considered. Travel Compensation Fund v Tambree	627
<i>Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment v Stevens</i> (2003) 132 FCR 31	
Reversed. Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment	193
<i>Kent v SS Maria Luisa [No 2]</i> (2003) 130 FCR 12 at 35-36	
Referred to. CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic)	98
<i>Kotteakos v United States</i> (1946) 328 US 750	
Approved. Weiss v The Queen	300
<i>Lange v Australian Broadcasting Corporation</i> (1997) 189 CLR 520	
Considered. APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW)	322

<i>Lucy v The Commonwealth</i> (1923) 33 CLR 229	
Applied. Jarratt v Commissioner of Police (NSW)	44
<i>Mallard v The Queen</i> (2003) 28 WAR 1	
Reversed. Mallard v The Queen	125
<i>March v E & MH Stramare Pty Ltd</i> (1991) 171 CLR 506	
Considered. Travel Compensation Fund v Tambree	627
<i>McGarry v The Queen</i> (2001) 207 CLR 121	
Applied. Strong v The Queen	1
<i>McVicar v Commissioner for Railways (NSW)</i> (1951) 83 CLR 521	
Applied. Jarratt v Commissioner of Police (NSW)	44
<i>Mickelberg v The Queen</i> (1989) 167 CLR 259 at 312	
Considered. Mallard v The Queen	125
<i>O'Dea v Allstates Leasing System (WA) Pty Ltd</i> (1983) 152 CLR 359	
Considered. Ringrow Pty Ltd v BP Australia Pty Ltd	656
<i>Police (NSW), Commissioner of v Jarratt</i> (2003) 59 NSWLR 87	
Reversed. Jarratt v Commissioner of Police (NSW)	44
<i>R v Banditt</i> (2004) 151 A Crim R 215	
Affirmed. Banditt v The Queen	262
<i>R v Chard</i> [1984] AC 279 at 289-291	
Considered. Mallard v The Queen	125
<i>R v Daly</i> [1968] VR 257 at 258-259	
Approved. Banditt v The Queen	262
<i>R v Morgan</i> [1976] AC 182	
Applied. Banditt v The Queen	262
<i>R v Strong</i> (2003) 141 A Crim R 56	
Affirmed. Strong v The Queen	1
<i>R v Weiss</i> (2004) 8 VR 388	
Reversed. Weiss v The Queen	300
<i>Residential Tenancies Tribunal (NSW), Re; Ex parte Defence Housing Authority (1997) 190 CLR 410 at 459</i>	
Applied. Jarratt v Commissioner of Police (NSW)	44
<i>Ringrow Pty Ltd v BP Australia Pty Ltd</i> (2004) 209 ALR 32	
Affirmed. Ringrow Pty Ltd v BP Australia Pty Ltd	656
<i>Saunders v Vautier</i> (1841) 4 Beav 115 [49 ER 282]	
Considered. CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic)	98
<i>Sir Moses Montefiore Jewish Home v Howell & Co (No 7) Pty Ltd</i> [1984] 2 NSWLR 406 at 410-411	
Approved. CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic)	98
<i>State Revenue (Vic), Commissioner of v CPT Custodian Pty Ltd</i> (2003) 8 VR 532	
Reversed. CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic)	98
<i>State Revenue (Vic), Commissioner of v Karingal 2 Holdings Pty Ltd</i> (2003) 8 VR 532	
Varied. CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic)	98

TABLE OF CASES JUDICIALLY CONSIDERED

ix

<i>Tambree v Travel Compensation Fund</i> [2004] Aust Contract Rep 90-195 Reversed. Travel Compensation Fund v Tambree	627
<i>Victoria v The Commonwealth and Hayden</i> (1975) 134 CLR 338 Referred to. Combet v The Commonwealth	494
<i>Williamson v The Commonwealth</i> (1907) 5 CLR 174 Applied. Jarratt v Commissioner of Police (NSW)	44

STATUTES, RULES, ETC JUDICIALLY CONSIDERED

COMMONWEALTH CONSTITUTION

Ch III: APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW)	322
s 81: Combet v The Commonwealth	494
s 83: Combet v The Commonwealth	494
s 92: APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW)	322
s 109: APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW)	322

COMMONWEALTH

Appropriation Act (No 1) 2005-2006

s 3 : Combet v The Commonwealth	494
s 4: Combet v The Commonwealth	494
s 7: Combet v The Commonwealth	494
s 8: Combet v The Commonwealth	494
s 15: Combet v The Commonwealth	494
Sch 1: Combet v The Commonwealth	494

Copyright Act 1968

s 10(1): Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment	193
s 21(1A): Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment	193
s 21(6): Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment	193
s 24: Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment	193
s 116A(1): Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment	193
s 116A(5): Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment	193
s 116D: Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment	193

Excise Act 1901

s 144: Chief Executive Officer of Customs v El Hajje	159
--	-----

Judiciary Act 1903

s 78A: Chief Executive Officer of Customs v El Hajje	159
--	-----

NEW SOUTH WALES

Crimes Act 1900

s 61I: Banditt v The Queen	262
s 61R: Banditt v The Queen	262
s 112(1): Banditt v The Queen	262

Fair Trading Act 1987

s 42: Travel Compensation Fund v Tambree	627
s 68: Travel Compensation Fund v Tambree	627

Habitual Criminals Act 1957

s 4(1): Strong v The Queen	1
s 6: Strong v The Queen	1

Legal Profession Act 1987

s 38J: APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW)	322
s 216: APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW)	322

Legal Profession Regulation 2002

Pt 14: APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW) 322

Police Service Act 1990

s 51(1): Jarratt v Commissioner of Police (NSW) 44

s 51(1A): Jarratt v Commissioner of Police (NSW) 44

VICTORIA**Crimes Act 1958**

s 568(1): Weiss v The Queen 300

Land Act 1958

s 3(1): CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) 98

s 6: CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) 98

s 8: CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) 98

s 39: CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) 98

s 44: CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) 98

s 45: CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) 98

WESTERN AUSTRALIA**Sentencing Act 1995**

s 140(1)(a): Mallard v The Queen 125

TABLE OF CASES CITED IN THE JUDGMENTS

Note: The page numbers are those where the case is cited in each judgment in a report

Abdul Rahim v King-Emperor (1946)	310
Abebe v The Commonwealth (1999)	621
Acron Pacific Ltd v Offshore Oil NL (1985)	663
Actors and Announcers Equity Association of Australia v Fontana Films Pty Ltd (1982)	457
Adelaide Steamship Co Ltd v The King and Attorney-General (Cth) (1912) ..	172, 183
Ainsworth v Criminal Justice Commission (1992)	624
Aird, Re; Ex parte Alpert (2004)	186
Al-Kateb v Godwin (2004)	57, 186, 256, 443
Allan v Transurban City Link Ltd (2001)	645
Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd v GSF Australia Pty Ltd (2005)	639, 642-644, 647
Amalgamated Society of Engineers v Adelaide Steamship Co Ltd (1920)	443, 484
Amalgamated Society of Engineers v Adelaide Steamship Co Ltd (1921)	443
AMEV Finance Ltd v Artes Studios Thoroughbreds Pty Ltd (1989)	663
AMEV-UDC Finance Ltd v Austin (1986)	663, 666, 667, 669
AMS v AIF (1999)	353, 363, 393, 394, 456, 460, 461
Andrews v Director of Public Prosecutions (UK) (1937)	266
Annetts v McCann (1990)	51, 56, 61, 80, 88
Ansett Transport Industries (Operations) Pty Ltd v The Commonwealth (1977)	66
Ansett Transport Industries (Operations) Pty Ltd v Wardley (1980)	425, 427, 428
APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW) (2005)	604, 620
Archer Shee v Garland (1930)	115
Arjon Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) (2003) .	107, 108, 112, 117, 118
Ashby v White (1703)	412, 428
Attorney-General (Cth) v Breckler (1999)	418
Attorney-General (Cth) v Oates (1999)	61
Attorney-General (Cth) v The Queen (1957)	364
Attorney-General (NSW) v Brewery Employees Union (NSW) (Union Label Case) (1908)	171, 419
Attorney-General (NSW) v Quin (1990)	63
Attorney-General (UK) v De Keyser's Royal Hotel Ltd (1920)	70
Attorney-General (Vic) v The Commonwealth (1945)	522, 553, 568, 577, 595-597,
	614
Attorney-General (Vic); Ex rel Black v The Commonwealth (1981)	618
Attorney-General v Wilts United Dairies Ltd (1921)	535
Attorney-General (NSW) v Perpetual Trustee Co (Ltd) (1952)	81
Attorney-General (NSW) v Perpetual Trustee Co (Ltd) (1955)	66
Auckland Harbour Board v The King (1923)	535, 597, 598, 605
Austin v The Commonwealth (2003)	412, 453
Austral Pacific Group Ltd v Airservices Australia (2000)	365
Australian Broadcasting Commission v Industrial Court (SA) (1977)	425
Australian Broadcasting Corporation v Lenah Game Meats Pty Ltd (2001)	439, 477

Australian Broadcasting Corporation v Redmore Pty Ltd (1987)	249
Australian Capital Television Pty Ltd v The Commonwealth (1992) .	393, 409,
	438, 453, 619
Australian Communist Party v The Commonwealth (1951)	249, 351, 416,
	441, 579, 617, 619, 650
Australian Conservation Foundation v The Commonwealth (1979)	620
Australian Institute of Marine and Power Engineers v Secretary, Department of Transport (1986)	622
Australian Mutual Provident Society v Goulden (1986) ...	354, 355, 400, 401,
	432, 489
Australian Securities and Investments Commission v Edensor Nominees Pty Ltd (2001)	405, 407, 444
Australian Tape Manufacturers Association Ltd v The Commonwealth (1993)	200, 241, 617
Australian Video Retailers Association v Warner Home Video Pty Ltd (2001)	217, 221, 236
 Baker v Archer-Shee (1927)	115
Baker v The Queen (2004)	25
Balenzuela v De Gail (1959)	308
Banks v Dretke (2004)	152
Baron De Rutzen v Farr (1835)	307
Barratt v Howard (2000)	61
Barton v The Commonwealth (1974)	70
Bass v Permanent Trustee Co Ltd (1999)	624
Bateman's Bay Local Aboriginal Land Council v Aboriginal Community Benefit Fund Pty Ltd (1998)	619-622
Bath v Alston Holdings Pty Ltd (1988)	391
Bato Star Fishing (Pty) Ltd v Minister of Environmental Affairs (2004) .	186,
	420
Baxter v Ah Way (1909)	171, 172, 177, 181-183
Bayside City Council v Telstra Corporation Ltd (2004)	399
Beckwith v The Queen (1976)	179, 260
Bell v Lever Bros Ltd (1931)	485
Bennett v Minister of Community Welfare (1992)	647
Berger v United States (1935)	152, 156
BHP Billiton Ltd v Schultz (2004)	389, 405
Blackie & Sons Ltd v Lothian Book Publishing Co Pty Ltd (1921)	222
Blair v Curran (1939)	120
Boilermakers Case (1956)	185, 365, 405, 408-411, 439, 442, 452, 618
Boland v Yates Property Corporation Pty Ltd (1999)	391
Bolton, Re; Ex parte Beane (1987)	241
Brady v Maryland (1963)	151
Brady v Thornton (1947)	188
Bray v Ford (1895)	307
Bread Manufacturers of NSW v Evans (1981)	447
British Medical Association v The Commonwealth (1949)	378, 556, 622
Broken Hill South Ltd v Commissioner of Taxation (NSW) (1937)	482
Brown v West (1990)	535, 575, 580, 586, 593, 596-598, 601-605, 609,
	616-618, 621-623
Buck v Bavone (1976)	389

Burbank, City of v Lockheed Air Terminal Inc (1973)	436
Butler v Attorney-General (Vic) (1961)	373
Butt v Long (1953)	667
Byrne v Australian Airlines Ltd (1995)	50, 68
Caltex Oil (Australia) Pty Ltd v Dredge Willemstad (1976)	639
Caparo Industries Plc v Dickman (1990)	643, 648, 649
Carey v The Commonwealth (1921)	87
CBS Songs Ltd v Amstrad Consumer Electronics Plc (1988)	200
CDJ v VAJ (1998)	186
Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corporation v Public Service Commission of New York (1980)	362
Chappel v Hart (1998)	642, 646, 647, 649, 651
Charles v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1954)	115, 116
Chester v The Queen (1988)	16, 25, 30, 31
Chu Kheng Lim v Minister for Immigration, Local Government and Ethnic Affairs (1992)	364
CIC Insurance Ltd v Bankstown Football Club Ltd (1997)	230
Cincinnati Soap Co v United States (1937)	522, 577, 594
City of Burbank v Lockheed Air Terminal Inc (1973)	436
Civil Service Unions, Council of v Minister for Civil Service (1984) .	65, 66,
	68
Claflin v Claflin (1889)	119
Clyde Engineering Co Ltd v Cowburn (1926)	424
Codelfa Construction Pty Ltd v State Rail Authority (NSW) (1982)	485
Cole v Whitfield (1988)	353, 354, 390, 391, 456-458, 461, 463, 481, 482
Coleman v Power (2004)	186, 256, 350, 359-361, 402, 438-440, 444, 451,
	477, 481, 485
Colina, Re; Ex parte Torney (1999)	396
Colvin v Bradley Brothers Pty Ltd (1943)	425
Commercial Radio Coffs Harbour v Fuller (1986)	401, 427, 428, 435
Commonwealth, The v Bank of NSW (1949)	444
Commonwealth, The v Colonial Ammunition Co Ltd (1924) ...	573, 597, 610
Commonwealth, The v Mewett (1997)	441
Commonwealth, The v Queensland (1975)	364-366, 369
Commonwealth, The v Western Australia (1999)	432
Commonwealth, The v Yarmirr (2001)	312, 567, 645
Computer Edge Pty Ltd v Apple Computer Inc (1986)	215, 258
Conway v The Queen (2002)	306, 308, 309, 317
Cormack v Cope (1974)	620
Costa & Duppe Properties Pty Ltd v Duppe (1986)	110, 113-115
Coutts v The Commonwealth (1985)	50, 64, 69, 87, 95
Crampton v The Queen (2000)	35
Crane v Frohmiller (1935)	598
Crease v Barrett (1835)	306
Croome v Tasmania (1997)	181, 378, 417
Cross v Barnes Towing and Salvage (Qld) Pty Ltd (2005)	390
Cunard SS Co v Mellon (1922)	305, 462
Cunliffe v The Commonwealth (1994)	350, 353, 367, 392, 394, 402-404,
	439, 440, 451, 456, 458-461, 463, 669

Customs, Chief Executive Officer of v El Hajje (2002)	163, 167, 168, 176, 178, 192
Customs, Chief Executive Officer of v El Hajje (2005)	260, 419, 420, 604, 612
Customs, Chief Executive Officer of v Labrador Liquor Wholesale Pty Ltd (2003)	171, 172, 175, 177, 179, 181, 185, 192
Customs, Collector of v Pozzolanic Enterprises Pty Ltd (1993)	179
Cutter v Powell (1795)	63
Darling Casino Ltd v NSW Casino Control Authority (1997)	407
Data Access Corporation v Powerflex Services Pty Ltd (1999)	222
David Grant & Co Pty Ltd v Westpac Banking Corporation (1995)	381
Davis v Elmira Savings Bank (1896)	437
Davis v The Commonwealth (1988)	617
De Pardo v Legal Practitioners Complaints Committee (2000)	395, 396
Del Vecchio v Couchy (2002)	485
Derry v Peek (1889)	265
De Rutzen (Baron) v Farr (1835)	307
Dietrich v The Queen (1992)	185, 439
Dingjan, Re; Ex parte Wagner (1995)	371, 447
DKLR Holding Co (No 2) Pty Ltd v Commissioner of Stamp Duties (NSW) (1982)	114
Dobinson v Crabb (1990)	428
Don King Productions Inc v Warren (1998)	119
Dow Jones & Co Inc v Gutnick (2002)	388
Driscoll v The Queen (1977)	316
Dunlop Pneumatic Tyre Co Ltd v New Garage & Motor Co Ltd (1914) .	662,
	663, 666, 667
Dunn v The Queen (1895)	87
Dyers v The Queen (2002)	158
Education, Director-General of v Sutting (1987)	63, 75, 79
Edwards v United Kingdom (1992)	154
Egan v Willis (1998)	601
El Hajje v Chief Executive Officer of Customs (2003)	163, 169, 176, 178, 179, 191
Elphinstone (Lord) v Monkland Iron & Coal Co (1886)	662, 668
Emmens v Elderton (1853)	63
Enever v The King (1906)	49, 65, 66, 81
English and Scottish Mercantile Investment Co Ltd v Brunton (1892)	265
Environment Agency v Empress Car Co (Abertillery) Ltd (1998)	642
Esanda Finance Corporation Ltd v Plessnig (1989)	663, 667
Evgeniou v The Queen (1964)	266
F, Re; Ex parte F (1986)	390
FAI Insurances Ltd v Winneke (1982)	51, 62
Fairfax v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1965)	457
Fardon v Attorney-General (Qld) (2004)	25
Farrell v The Queen (1998)	305
Favell v Queensland Newspapers Pty Ltd (2005)	316, 648

Felton v Mulligan (1971)	377, 406, 455
Festa v The Queen (2001)	313, 316
Fire Commissioners (NSW), Board of v Ardouin (1961)	361
Fitt v United Kingdom (2000)	155
Fitzgerald v FJ Leonhardt Pty Ltd (1997)	111
Fitzgerald v Penn (1954)	646, 653
Flast v Cohen (1968)	620
Fleming v The Queen (1998)	305, 312
Fletcher v Nott (1938)	50, 66, 68, 69, 79, 87
Florida Bar v Went For It, Inc (1995)	424
Foreman & Sons Pty Ltd, In re; Uther v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1947)	366, 367, 437
Forestry Commission (NSW) v Stefanetto (1976)	665
Fox v Percy (2003)	316
 Gabriel v Ah Mook (1924)	172
Galaxy Electronics Pty Ltd v Sega Enterprises Ltd (1997)	220, 221, 229
Gartside v Inland Revenue Commissioners (1967)	110, 114, 119
Geddes v Magrath (1933)	63
Gipp v The Queen (1998)	35, 150, 305
Glenn v Federal Commissioner of Land Tax (1915)	108, 112, 113, 120
Goldberg v Law Institute (Vic) (1972)	442
Golder v United Kingdom (1975)	441, 442
Goodman v Pocock (1850)	63
Gould v Brown (1998)	405
Gould v Stuart (1896)	63, 66, 67, 87
Goulding v James (1996)	118
Governor, Goulburn Correctional Centre, Re; Ex parte Eastman (1999) ..	405
Graham Barclay Oysters Pty Ltd v Ryan (2002)	450, 649
Grain Pool (WA) v The Commonwealth (2000)	256
Grannall v Marrickville Margarine Pty Ltd (1955)	458
Grant (David) & Co Pty Ltd v Westpac Banking Corporation (1995)	381
Gratwick v Johnson (1945)	390, 393
Green v The Queen (1971)	275, 276, 298
Greene v The King (1949)	182
Grey v The Queen (2001)	133, 151, 152, 156
Griffiths v Haines (1984)	81
 Ha v New South Wales (1997)	189, 426
Hamlyn & Co v Wood & Co (1891)	485
Haoucher v Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs (1990)	88
Harrington v Lowe (1996)	446, 447
Haughian v The Queen (1985)	275
Hayes v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1956)	169, 174, 179, 189
Hegarty v Shine (1878)	651
Heimann v The Commonwealth (1938)	485
Henville v Walker (2001)	639, 640, 647
Highland Council v Patience (1997)	381
Hill v Florida (1945)	437
Hills v Canada (1988)	186

Histollo Pty Ltd v Director-General, National Parks and Wildlife Service (1998)	21
HKSAR v Lau Ngai Chu (2002)	154
HKSAR v Lee Ming Tee (2003)	154
Hocking v Bell (1945)	315
Holly v Director of Public Works (1988)	67
Hospital Provident Fund Pty Ltd v Victoria (1953)	458
House v The King (1936)	8-12, 16, 22, 28, 29, 33, 39, 40
I & L Securities Pty Ltd v HTW Valuers (Brisbane) Pty Ltd (2002)	639, 644-646
Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for, Re; Ex parte Miah (2001)	55
Jackson v Harrison (1978)	651
Jackson v Sterling Industries Ltd (1987)	131
Jarratt v Commissioner of Police (NSW) (2002)	48, 60, 78
Jobson v Johnson (1988)	665
Johanns v Livestock Marketing Association (2005)	584, 585
John Robertson & Co Ltd (In liq) v Ferguson Transformers Pty Ltd (1973)	444
John v Rees (1968)	95
Johnson v United Kingdom (1997)	33
Jones v Rath Packing Co (1977)	436
Josephson v Young (1900)	67
Judiciary and Navigation Acts, In re (1921)	351
Kable v Director of Public Prosecutions (NSW) (1996) 25, 185, 365, 407, 433, 439, 484	
Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment Inc v Ball (2004)	250
Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment v Stevens (2001)	205
Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment v Stevens (2002) . 204, 205, 208, 209, 211, 212, 215-218, 220, 222, 228, 229, 233, 240, 242, 244, 246, 249, 255	
Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment v Stevens (2003)	205, 211-216, 219, 221, 224, 229-231, 233, 235, 237, 239, 240, 245, 247-250
Kalibia, SS, Owners of v Wilson (1910)	446
Karingal 2 Holdings Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) (2002)	106, 116
Kartinyeri v The Commonwealth (1998)	441, 443
Kaye v Attorney-General (Tas) (1956)	68, 87
Kelly v Department of Corrective Services (2001)	75, 87, 96
Kent v SS Maria Luisa [No 2] (2003)	109, 110, 112, 121
Kioa v West (1985)	88
Klein v Domus Pty Ltd (1963)	61
Kodeeswaran v Attorney-General (Ceylon) (1969)	79
Kotteakos v United States (1946)	317
Kuwait Airways Corporation v Iraqi Airways Co [No 6] (2002) 643, 648	
Kyles v Whitley (1995)	152, 156
La Fontaine v The Queen (1976)	266, 267, 275

Lambert v Weichelt (1954)	181
Land Tax (NSW), Chief Commissioner of v Macary Manufacturing Pty Ltd (1999)	107
Lange v Australian Broadcasting Corporation (1997) .	350, 351, 356, 358-362,
367, 402-404, 438-441, 444-446, 449-452, 454, 477, 478, 480, 481, 485,	
582, 669	
Lawless v The Queen (1979)	150, 151, 156
Le Mesurier v Connor (1929)	405, 407, 433
Leeth v The Commonwealth (1992)	407
Levy v Victoria (1997)	373, 380, 381, 418, 440
Liverpool City Council v Irwin (1976)	485
Livingston v Commissioner of Stamp Duties (Qld) (1960)	114, 115
Lord Elphinstone v Monkland Iron & Coal Co (1886)	662, 668
Lowndes v The Queen (1999)	16, 25, 30, 31
Lucy v The Commonwealth (1923)	63, 67, 87, 91
 M v Home Office (1993)	65
M v The Queen (1994)	316
Mabo v Queensland [No 2] (1992)	154
Macks, Re; Ex parte Saint (2000)	405, 406, 408, 410, 412, 428
Macleod v Australian Securities and Investments Commission (2002)	406
Makin v Attorney-General (NSW) (1893)	311, 312
Mallard v The Queen (1997)	142
Mallard v The Queen (2003)	130, 134, 140, 142-145
Malloch v Aberdeen Corporation (1971)	51
Mansell v Beck (1956)	458
March v E & MH Stramare Pty Ltd (1991)	645-647, 651, 653-655
Margaret Tinkler's Case (1781)	306
Marks v The Commonwealth (1964)	64-66
McBain, Re; Ex parte Australian Catholic Bishops Conference (2002)	380,
616, 619	
McCulloch v Maryland (1819)	436
McGarry v The Queen (2001)	9, 13-16, 25-27, 29-31
McGinty v Western Australia (1996)	409
McKerlie v New South Wales (2000)	81
McLean, Ex parte (1930)	424, 437
McLeod v HM Advocate [No 2] (1997)	154
McVicar v Commissioner for Railways (NSW) (1951)	59, 63
Mechanical & General Inventions Co v Austin (1935)	315
Medlin v State Government Insurance Commission (1995)	638
Melbourne Corporation v The Commonwealth (1947)	453, 609
Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer Studios Inc v Grokster Ltd (2005)	250, 256, 258
Metropolitan Bank Ltd v Pooley (1885)	131
Mickelberg v The Queen (1989)	131, 144
Milicevic v Campbell (1975)	183
Miller v TCN Channel Nine Pty Ltd (1986)	390
Mobil Oil Australia Pty Ltd v Victoria (2002)	354, 389, 483
Modbury Triangle Shopping Centre Pty Ltd v Anzil (2000)	651, 655
Montefiore (Sir Moses) Jewish Home v Howell & Co (No 7) Pty Ltd (1984)	120

TABLE OF CASES CITED

xix

Moorcock, The (1889)	485
Morris v The Queen (1987)	316
Mraz v The Queen (1955)	311, 313
MSP Nominees Pty Ltd v Commissioner of Stamps (SA) (1999)	111
Mulholland v Australian Electoral Commission (2004)	402, 477
Munchies Management Pty Ltd v Belperio (1988)	645
Myers v Elman (1939)	349
 Nash v Florida Industrial Commission (1967)	436
Nationwide News Pty Ltd v Wills (1992) . 390, 392-394, 456, 457, 459, 619	
Naxakis v Western General Hospital (1999)	180
Neil Pearson and Co Pty Ltd v Comptroller-General of Customs (1995) . 177	
Neilson v Overseas Projects Corporation of Victoria Ltd (2005)	648
Nelson v Nelson (1995)	111
Nelungaloo Pty Ltd v The Commonwealth (1947)	81
Network Ten Pty Ltd v TCN Channel Nine Pty Ltd (2004)	249
New South Wales v Bardolph (1934)	561, 607
New South Wales v Lepore (2003)	655
New South Wales v The Commonwealth (1908)	569, 577, 597
New South Wales v The Commonwealth (1983)	400, 489
New South Wales, Bank of v The Commonwealth (1948)	372, 392, 420
Newcastle and Hunter River Steamship Co Ltd v Attorney-General (Cth) (1921)	447
Newcrest Mining (WA) Ltd v The Commonwealth (1997)	443
News Ltd v South Sydney District Rugby League Football Club Ltd (2003)	247
Nichols v Eaton (1875)	118
North Eastern Dairy Co Ltd v Dairy Industry Authority of NSW (1975) . 366, 368, 399	
Northern Suburbs General Cemetery Reserve Trust v The Commonwealth (1993)	593
Northern Territory v GPAO (1999)	406
 O Gilpin Ltd v Commissioner for Road Transport and Tramways (NSW) (1935)	458
O'Dea v Allstates Leasing System (WA) Pty Ltd (1983)	663, 667
O'Sullivan v Noarlunga Meat Ltd (1954)	373
O'Sullivan, Ex parte; Re Craig (1944)	177
Onus v Alcoa of Australia Ltd (1981)	580, 620, 622
 P v P (1994)	402, 433, 489
Pacific Film Laboratories Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1970)	241
Palgo Holdings Pty Ltd v Gowans (2005)	186, 241, 249, 260
Patterson, Re; Ex parte Taylor (2001)	171, 522
Pearce v Florencia (1976)	389, 483
Pearce v Thompson (1988)	154
Pearson (Neil) and Co Pty Ltd v Comptroller-General of Customs (1995) . 177	
Permanent Trustee Australia Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) (2004)	575
Philip Morris Ltd v Commissioner of Business Franchises (Vic) (1989) . 368	

TABLE OF CASES CITED

Pidoto v Victoria (1943)	371
Pigram v Attorney-General (NSW) (1975)	667
Plaintiff S157/2002 v The Commonwealth (2003)	186, 249, 256, 416, 441, 579, 617, 650
Police (Metropolitan), Commissioner of v Caldwell (1981)	266, 274, 294
Police (NSW), Commissioner of v Jarratt (2003)	49, 60, 79, 80, 87
Police (NSW), Commissioner of v Tanos (1958)	88
Polyukhovich v The Commonwealth (War Crimes Act Case) (1991) .	364, 368
Port MacDonnell Professional Fishermen's Association Inc v South Australia (1989)	389
Potter v Minahan (1908)	256
Primus, Re (1978)	341, 439
Project Blue Sky Inc v Australian Broadcasting Authority (1998)	69
Public Prosecutions, Director of v Hutchinson (1990)	446
Public Prosecutions (NT), Director of v WJI (2004)	275
R v Adams (1935)	179
R v Apostilides (1984)	150, 151, 155
R v Associated Northern Collieries (1911)	183
R v Australian Broadcasting Tribunal; Ex parte Hardiman (1980)	466
R v Ball (1807)	306
R v Banditt (2004)	267, 287, 288
R v Bertrand (1869)	309
R v Brown (1997)	153, 154
R v Chaplin (1995)	152
R v Chard (1983)	131, 144
R v Commonwealth Court of Conciliation and Arbitration; Ex parte Whybrow & Co (1910)	446
R v Couper (1985)	317
R v Cox; Ex parte Smith (1945)	68
R v Crabbe (1985)	266
R v Daly (1968)	272, 275, 290
R v Egan (1985)	297
R v Egger (1993)	152
R v Ehrman (1911)	23
R v Flannery (1968)	272
R v G (2003)	266, 267, 272, 274
R v Gallagher (1997)	308
R v Gee (2003)	406
R v Gibson (1887)	307, 308
R v Governor of Brockhill Prison; Ex parte Evans [No 2] (2000)	33
R v Griffin (1969)	32
R v Grills (1910)	308, 312
R v H (2004)	155
R v Hemsley (1988)	288
R v Henderson (1966)	317
R v Henning (1990)	288
R v Hildebrandt (1963)	317
R v Hughes (2000)	419, 420
R v Hush; Ex parte Devanny (1932)	172, 173, 177, 183

R v Keane (1994)	154
R v Kirby; Ex parte Boilermakers Society of Australia (1956) .	185, 365, 405,
	408-411, 439, 442, 452, 618
R v Kitchener (1993)	274, 288
R v Konstandopoulos (1997)	305
R v Lavender (2005)	260, 645
R v Lawrence (1981)	294
R v Ling (1996)	153
R v Lords Commissioners of the Treasury (1872)	585
R v Macfarlane; Ex parte O'Flanagan (1923)	428
R v Maes (1975)	293
R v McEwan (1979)	293
R v McLachlan (1999)	305
R v Mills (1999)	153
R v Moffatt (1997)	30
R v Morgan (1975)	271-276, 289-297
R v Murphy (1868)	309
R v Murphy (1985)	408, 410
R v O'Connor (1995)	152
R v Palmer (1980)	180
R v Pigg (1982)	294
R v Quinn; Ex parte Consolidated Foods Corporation (1977)	368
R v Riley (1973)	30
R v Roberts (1959)	15, 27
R v S (1983)	274, 296
R v Secretary of State for the Home Department; Ex parte Simms (1999) .	443
R v Shaqlane (2001)	154
R v Smithers; Ex parte Benson (1912)	393
R v Sperotto (1970)	271, 293
R v Stanley (1920)	24
R v Steele (1910)	23
R v Stinchcombe (1991)	152, 153, 156
R v Storey (1978)	313, 316
R v Strong (2003)	6, 11, 15-23, 25-27, 31-33, 36-38, 40, 41, 43
R v Swain (1991)	33
R v Taillerfer (2003)	152
R v Taylor (2003)	154
R v Teal (1809)	306
R v Tolmie (1995)	287, 288
R v Tomkins (1985)	381
R v Treble (1810)	306
R v Ward (1992)	153
R v Warner (1968)	292
R v Weiss (2004)	304, 315
R v Whelan (1868)	309
R v White (1968)	23-25, 30
R v Wozniak (1977)	271, 272, 295
Read v The Commonwealth (1988)	116
Real Estate Institute (NSW) v Blair (1946)	556, 622
Refugee Review Tribunal, Re; Ex parte Aala (2000)	462

Reigate v Union Manufacturing Co (Ramsbottom) Ltd (1918)	485
Reilly v The King (1933)	79
Residential Tenancies Tribunal (NSW), Re; Ex parte Defence Housing Authority (1997)	70
Residual Assco Group Ltd v Spalvins (2000)	371, 406, 419, 420
Ridge v Baldwin (1963)	50, 51, 57, 65, 90, 91
Ringrow Pty Ltd v BP Australia Ltd (2003)	661-663, 666, 670
Ringrow Pty Ltd v BP Australia Pty Ltd (2004)	661, 670
Roberts v Bass (2002)	181, 439, 477, 616
Robertson (John) & Co Ltd (In liq) v Ferguson Transformers Pty Ltd (1973)	444
Robophone Facilities Ltd v Blank (1966)	669
Roper v Simmons (2005)	443
Rosenberg v Percival (2001)	646
Roxborough v Rothmans of Pall Mall Australia Ltd (2001)	632
Roy Morgan Research Centre Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) (2001)	186, 312, 567, 645
RPS v The Queen (2000)	155, 177, 317
Ruddock v Taylor (2003)	637, 643, 648
Ruddock v Taylor (2005)	637, 648
Ruhani v Director of Police (2005)	625
Russell v Russell (1976)	406
Ryder v Foley (1906)	67, 68
Salemi v MacKellar [No 2] (1977)	88
Sanders v Snell (1998)	89
Saunders v Vautier (1841)	118-120
Saunders v Vautier (1841)	118-121
Schiffmann v Whitton (1916)	172
Schmidt v Rosewood Trust Ltd (2003)	110
Sega Enterprises Ltd v Galaxy Electronics Pty Ltd (1996)	220
Sellars v Adelaide Petroleum NL (1994)	640
Shelton v King (1913)	118
Shenton v Smith (1895)	50, 87
Shop, Distributive and Allied Employees Association v Minister for Industrial Affairs (SA) (1995)	620, 622
Silbert v Director of Public Prosecutions (WA) (2004)	157
Sir Moses Montefiore Jewish Home v Howell & Co (No 7) Pty Ltd (1984)	120
Slaight Communications Inc v Davidson (1989)	186
Smith v Jenkins (1970)	651
Solicitor, Re a (1915)	442
Solicitor, A v Council of Law Society (NSW) (2004)	348, 349
Solomons v District Court (NSW) (2002)	181, 186, 353, 406
Sony Computer Entertainment America Inc v Gamemasters (1999)	250
Sony Computer Entertainment Inc v Lik Sang International Ltd (2003) ..	250
Sony Computer Entertainment v Edmunds (2002)	250
Sony Corporation of America v Universal City Studios Inc (1984) ..	200, 257, 258
South Australia v Tanner (1989)	381

Stamp Duties (NSW), Chief Commissioner of v Buckle (1998)	110, 121
Stamp Duties (NSW), Chief Commissioner of v ISPT Pty Ltd (1998)	112
Stamp Duties (NSW), Commissioner of v Owens [No 2] (1953)	444
Stamp Duties (Qld), Commissioner of v Livingston (1964)	114
State Authorities Superannuation Board v Commissioner of State Taxation (WA) (1996)	389
State Ex rel; Norfolk Beet-Sugar Co v Moore (1896)	598
State Revenue (Vic), Commissioner of v Karingal 2 Holdings Pty Ltd (2003)	106, 108-110, 121
State Revenue (Vic), Commissioner of v Pioneer Concrete (Vic) Pty Ltd (2002)	84
Stern v McArthur (1988)	663
Stevens v Kabushiki Kaisha Sony Computer Entertainment (2005) .	312, 567
Stirland v Director of Public Prosecutions (UK) (1944)	314
Stock Motor Ploughs Ltd v Forsyth (1932)	399-401, 411, 428, 429
Street v Queensland Bar Association (1989)	391
Strickler v Greene (1999)	152
Sue v Hill (1999)	59, 601
Sullivan v Moody (2001)	643, 649
Sunrise Crane, Owners of Ship v Cipta Sarana Marine Pty Ltd (2004) ...	649
Suttlng v Director-General of Education (1985)	50, 66, 87
Sweet v Parsley (1969)	292
Symes v Canada (1993)	186, 420
Symons v Schiffmann (1915)	172
Tambree v Travel Compensation Fund (2004)	630, 643, 647, 654
Tasmanian Steamers Pty Ltd v Lang (1938)	426
Taxation, Deputy Commissioner of v Richard Walter Pty Ltd (1995)	407
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Linter Textiles Australia Ltd (In liq) (2005)	112, 114
Taylor, Re (1984)	275
Telstra Corporation Ltd v Worthing (1999)	398, 401, 425, 428
Terry v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1920)	117
Theophanous v Herald & Weekly Times Ltd (1994)	351, 438, 481
Thomas Brown and Sons Ltd v Fazal Deen (1962)	651
Thomas v The King (1937)	292
Thompson v The Queen (1999)	16, 25, 31
Toowoomba Foundry Pty Ltd v The Commonwealth (1945)	378
Townsend's Case (1553)	409, 452
Tracey, Re; Ex parte Ryan (1989)	185
Travel Compensation Fund v Fry (2002)	630, 642, 644
Travel Compensation Fund v Travel Guide Pty Ltd (In liq) (1997) .	631, 644
Tringali v Stewardson Stubbs & Collett Pty Ltd (1966)	131
Trust Co of Australia Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Qld) (2003)	191, 249, 645
Truth About Motorways Pty Ltd v Macquarie Infrastructure Investment Management Ltd (2000)	621
Tyrwhitt v Wynne (1819)	306

Union Label Case (Attorney-General (NSW) v Brewery Employees Union (NSW)) (1908)	171, 419
Union Steamship Co of Australia Pty Ltd v King (1988)	389, 483
Union Trustee Co of Australia Ltd v Commissioner of Land Tax (Cth) (1915)	113
United States v Agurs (1976)	152
United States v Bagley (1985)	151, 152
United States v Butler (1936)	616
United States v United Foods Inc (2001)	585
United Transportation Union v State Bar of Michigan (1971)	439
Universal Film Manufacturing Co (Australasia) Ltd v New South Wales (1927)	419
University of Wollongong v Metwally (1984)	426
Veen v The Queen (1979)	30
Veen v The Queen [No 2] (1988)	30
Venkata Rao v Secretary of State for India (1936)	70
Victoria v The Commonwealth (1926)	618
Victoria v The Commonwealth (1937)	399, 400, 425, 428, 444
Victoria v The Commonwealth (1996)	371
Victoria v The Commonwealth and Hayden (1975) ..	522, 536, 557, 577, 579, 580, 586, 595-597, 601, 604, 605, 608, 610, 616-624
Victorian WorkCover Authority v Esso Australia Ltd (2001) ...	312, 567, 645
Viskauskas v Niland (1983)	437
Visy Paper Pty Ltd v Australian Competition and Consumer Commission (2003)	312, 567
Wakim, Re; Ex parte McNally (1999) .	185, 364, 405, 406, 408, 410, 426, 439
Walden v Hensler (1987)	30
Wallis v Downard-Pickford (North Queensland) Pty Ltd (1994)	428
War Crimes Act Case (Polyukhovich v The Commonwealth) (1991) .	364, 368
Ward v Special Criminal Court (1998)	154
Wardley Australia Ltd v Western Australia (1992)	646, 647, 650
Waterside Workers Federation of Australia v JW Alexander Ltd (1918) ..	439
Wells v Newfoundland (1999)	49, 50, 66
Wenn v Attorney-General (Vic) (1948)	399
Western Australia v Ward (1997)	395
Wharton v Masterman (1895)	120, 121
Wilde v The Queen (1988)	317
Williamson v Ah On (1926)	172
Williamson v The Commonwealth (1907)	63
Wilson v Anderson (2002)	256, 257
Wilson v Minister for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs (1996)	185, 439
Winterwerp v Netherlands (1979)	33
Wollondilly Shire Council v Picton Power Lines Pty Ltd (1994)	665
Woolmington v Director of Public Prosecutions (UK) (1935)	313
Wright v Doe d Tatham (1837)	307
Xerox Corporation v Harris County, Texas (1982)	436

TABLE OF CASES CITED

xxv

Young v Registrar, Court of Appeal [No 3] (1993)	21
--	----