

2008-2009

THE

COMMONWEALTH

LAW REPORTS

CASES DETERMINED  
IN THE  
HIGH COURT OF AUSTRALIA

EDITOR  
J D MERRALLS, AM, QC

VOLUME 238

LAWBOOK CO.

2009

**REPORTERS**

G J AHERN  
M Y BEARMAN  
M I BORSKY  
C G BUTTON  
G S CLARKE, SC  
L G DE FERRARI  
C J HORAN  
C LYE  
A D POUND  
J A REDWOOD  
D F C THOMAS  
P T VOUT  
P G WILLIS  
C P YOUNG

*BARRISTERS*

**PRODUCTION EDITOR**

CAROLYN MAY



**THOMSON REUTERS**

© 2009 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited  
ABN 64 058 914 668

Lawbook Co.

Published in Sydney

Printed by Ligare Pty Ltd, Riverwood, NSW

ISSN 0069-7133

JUSTICES OF THE HIGH COURT OF AUSTRALIA

DURING THE CURRENCY OF THIS VOLUME

THE HONOURABLE ANTHONY MURRAY GLEESON, AC,  
CHIEF JUSTICE  
(retired 30 August 2008)

THE HONOURABLE ROBERT SHENTON FRENCH, CHIEF JUSTICE  
(appointed 1 September 2008)

THE HONOURABLE WILLIAM MONTAGUE CHARLES GUMMOW, AC

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL DONALD KIRBY, AC, CMG  
(resigned 2 February 2009)

THE HONOURABLE KENNETH MADISON HAYNE, AC

THE HONOURABLE JOHN DYSON HEYDON, AC

THE HONOURABLE SUSAN MAREE CRENNAN, AC

THE HONOURABLE SUSAN MARY KIEFEL

THE HONOURABLE VIRGINIA MARGARET BELL  
(appointed 3 February 2009)

ATTORNEY-GENERAL

THE HONOURABLE ROBERT BRUCE MCCLELLAND, MP

**The mode of citation of this volume of  
the Commonwealth Law Reports will be as follows:  
238 CLR**

---

**TABLE OF CASES REPORTED  
IN THIS VOLUME**

Agricultural and Rural Finance Pty Ltd v Gardiner .....	570
Backoffice Investments Pty Ltd; Campbell v .....	304
Bakewell v The Queen .....	287
Burrell v The Queen .....	218
Campbell v Backoffice Investments Pty Ltd .....	304
Chesterton; Radio 2UE Sydney Pty Ltd v .....	460
Gardiner; Agricultural and Rural Finance Pty Ltd v .....	570
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v Kumar .....	448
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v SZIZO .....	627
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v SZJGV .....	642
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v SZJXO .....	642
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v SZKTI .....	489
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v SZLFX .....	507
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for; Sie Sok v .....	251
Kennon v Spry .....	366
Kennon; Spry v .....	366
Kumar v; Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v .....	448
Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
Puttick v Tenon Ltd .....	265
R; Bakewell v .....	287
R; Burrell v .....	218
Radio 2UE Sydney Pty Ltd v Chesterton .....	460
Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	516
Sie Sok v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship .....	251
Spry v Kennon .....	366
Spry; Kennon v .....	366
SZIZO; Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v .....	627
SZJGV; Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v .....	642
SZJXO; Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v .....	642
SZKTI; Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v .....	489

SZLFX; Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v .....	507
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of; Pape v .....	1
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of; Raftland Pty Ltd v .....	516
Tenon Ltd; Puttick v .....	265

## TABLE OF CASES JUDICIALLY CONSIDERED IN CASES REPORTED IN THIS VOLUME

<i>A v Hayden</i> (1984) 156 CLR 532	
Applied. Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v Kumar .....	448
<i>A G Securities v Vaughan</i> [1990] 1 AC 417 at 462-463	
Applied. Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	516
<i>Anthony Hordern &amp; Sons Ltd v Amalgamated Clothing and Allied Trades Union of Australia</i> (1932) 47 CLR 1	
Distinguished. Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZKTI .....	489
<i>Applicant VEAL of 2002 v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs</i> (2005) 225 CLR 88	
Applied. Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v Kumar .....	448
 <i>Bakewell v The Queen [No 3]</i> (2008) 22 NTLR 174	
Reversed. Bakewell v The Queen .....	287
<i>Butcher v Lachlan Elder Realty Pty Ltd</i> (2004) 218 CLR 592 at 623	
Approved. Campbell v Backoffice Investments Pty Ltd .....	304
 <i>Campbell v Backoffice Investments Pty Ltd</i> (2008) 66 ACSR 359; 26 ACLC 537	
Reversed. Campbell v Backoffice Investments Pty Ltd .....	304
<i>Commonwealth, The v John Fairfax &amp; Sons Ltd</i> (1980) 147 CLR 39	
Applied. Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v Kumar .....	448
<i>Commonwealth, The v Verwayen</i> (1990) 170 CLR 394	
Distinguished. Agricultural and Rural Finance Pty Ltd v Gardiner .....	570
 <i>Gacic v John Fairfax Publications Pty Ltd</i> (2006) 66 NSWLR 675	
Disapproved. Radio 2UE Sydney Pty Ltd v Chesterton .....	460
<i>Gardiner v Agricultural and Rural Finance Pty Ltd</i> [2008] Aust Contract Reports ¶¶90-274	
Varied. Agricultural and Rural Finance Pty Ltd v Gardiner .....	570
<i>Grierson v The King</i> (1938) 60 CLR 431	
Applied. Burrell v The Queen .....	218
 <i>Hoyt's Pty Ltd v Spencer</i> (1919) 27 CLR 133	
Distinguished. Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	516
 <i>Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v Sok</i> (2008) 165 FCR 586	
Reversed. Sie Sok v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship .....	251
 <i>Leon Fink Holdings Pty Ltd v Australian Film Commission</i> (1979) 141 CLR 672	
Applied. Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZKTI .....	489
 <i>MZXBQ v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship</i> (2008) 166 FCR 483 at 492	
Approved. Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZLFX .....	507

<i>Puttick v Fletcher Challenge Forests Pty Ltd</i> (2007) 18 VR 70 Reversed. <i>Puttick v Tenon Ltd</i> .....	265
<i>R v Burrell</i> (2007) 175 A Crim R 21 Reversed. <i>Burrell v The Queen</i> .....	218
<i>Radio 2UE Sydney Pty Ltd v Chesterton</i> [2008] Aust Torts Reports ¶81-946 Reversed. <i>Radio 2UE Sydney Pty Ltd v Chesterton</i> .....	460
<i>Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation</i> (2007) 65 ATR 336; [2007] ATC 4,104 Varied. <i>Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation</i> .....	516
<i>Regie Nationale des Usines Renault SA v Zhang</i> (2002) 210 CLR 491 Applied. <i>Puttick v Tenon Ltd</i> .....	265
<i>SAAP v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs</i> (2005) 228 CLR 294 Distinguished. <i>Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZIZO</i> .....	627
Referred to. <i>Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZKTI</i> .....	489
<i>SZBYR v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship</i> (2007) 81 ALJR 1190; 235 ALR 609 Applied. <i>Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZLFX</i> .....	507
<i>SZIZO v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship</i> (2008) 172 FCR 152 Reversed. <i>Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZIZO</i> .....	627
<i>SZJGV v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship</i> (2008) 170 FCR 515 Reversed. <i>Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZJGV</i> .....	642
<i>SZKLG v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship</i> (2007) 164 FCR 578 at 589 Approved. <i>Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZLFX</i> .....	507
<i>SZKTI v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship</i> (2008) 168 FCR 256 Distinguished. <i>Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZKTI</i> .....	489
<i>Stamp Duties (Qld), Commissioner of v Jolliffe</i> (1920) 28 CLR 178 at 181 Applied. <i>Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation</i> .....	516
<i>Stephens v Stephens</i> (2007) 212 FLR 362; 38 Fam LR 149; [2007] FLC ¶93-336 Affirmed. <i>Kennon v Spry</i> .....	366
<i>Upton v Brown</i> (1884) 26 Ch D 588 Explained. <i>Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation</i> .....	516
<i>Voth v Manildra Flour Mills Pty Ltd</i> (1990) 171 CLR 538 Applied. <i>Puttick v Tenon Ltd</i> .....	265

# STATUTES, RULES, ETC JUDICIALLY CONSIDERED

## COMMONWEALTH CONSTITUTION

s 51(ii): Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
s 51(xxxix): Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
s 61: Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
s 75(iii): Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
s 76(i): Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
s 81: Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
s 83: Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1

## COMMONWEALTH

### Acts Interpretation Act 1901

s 15A: Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
--	---

### Corporations Act 2001

s 232: Campbell v Backoffice Investments Pty Ltd .....	304
--	-----

### Family Law Act 1975

s 4(1): Kennon v Spry .....	366
s 4(2): Kennon v Spry .....	366
s 79(1)(a): Kennon v Spry .....	366
s 79(4): Kennon v Spry .....	366
s 80: Kennon v Spry .....	366
s 85A(1): Kennon v Spry .....	366
s 106B(1): Kennon v Spry .....	366
s 106B(3): Kennon v Spry .....	366

### Income Tax Assessment Act 1936

Pt III Div 6: Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	516
s 96: Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	516
s 97: Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	516
s 99A(4A)(a): Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	516
s 100A(1)(a): Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	516
s 100A(3A): Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	516
s 100A(7): Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	516

### Judiciary Act 1903

s 30(a): Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
--	---

### Migration Act 1958

s 65: Sie Sok v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship .....	251
s 91R(3): Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZJGV .....	642
s 347: Sie Sok v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship .....	251
s 359: Sie Sok v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship .....	251
s 359A: Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v Kumar .....	448
s 422B(2): Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZIZO .....	627
s 424: Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZKTI .....	489
s 424: Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZLFX .....	507
s 424A(1)(a): Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZLFX .....	507
s 424B: Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZKTI .....	489



s 424B: Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZLFX .....	507
s 425(1): Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZKTI .....	489
s 425A: Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZIZO .....	627
s 441A: Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZIZO .....	627
s 441G: Minister for Immigration and Citizenship v SZIZO .....	627
<b>Migration Regulations 1994</b>	
reg 1.15A(1): Sie Sok v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship .....	251
reg 15A(1A): Sie Sok v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship .....	251
reg 1.22(1): Sie Sok v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship .....	251
reg 1.23: Sie Sok v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship .....	251
<b>Tax Bonus for Working Australians Act (No 2) 2009</b>	
s 4(2): Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
s 5: Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
s 7: Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1
<b>Taxation Administration Act 1953</b>	
s 16: Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation .....	1

#### NEW SOUTH WALES

<b>Criminal Appeal Act 1912</b>	
s 12: Burrell v The Queen .....	218
<b>Criminal Appeal Rules 1952</b>	
r 50A: Burrell v The Queen .....	218
r 51-53: Burrell v The Queen .....	218
<b>Defamation Act 1974</b>	
s 4(2): Radio 2UE Sydney Pty Ltd v Chesterton .....	460
<b>Fair Trading Act 1987</b>	
s 42: Campbell v Backoffice Investments Pty Ltd .....	304

#### NORTHERN TERRITORY

<b>Prisoners (Interstate Transfer) Act</b>	
s 23(1): Bakewell v The Queen .....	287
<b>Sentencing (Crime of Murder) and Parole Reform Act 2003</b>	
s 18(a): Bakewell v The Queen .....	287
s 19(3): Bakewell v The Queen .....	287
s 23: Bakewell v The Queen .....	287

#### SOUTH AUSTRALIA

<b>Prisoners (Interstate Transfer) Act 1982</b>	
s 5: Bakewell v The Queen .....	287
s 25: Bakewell v The Queen .....	287
s 27: Bakewell v The Queen .....	287
s 28: Bakewell v The Queen .....	287

## TABLE OF CASES CITED IN THE JUDGMENTS

**Note: The page numbers are those where the case is cited in each judgment in a report**

A v Hayden (1984) .....	87, 456, 457
AAP Case (Victoria v The Commonwealth and Hayden) (1975) .	34, 35, 46, 48-53, 55, 60, 61, 63, 70, 71, 73, 78, 80, 87, 103, 106, 111, 113, 114, 116, 117, 124, 138, 165, 170, 175-178, 181, 187, 189, 191, 195, 196, 198, 199, 202-208, 210-212, 214
Abigroup Ltd v Abignano (1992) .....	402
Accent Management Ltd v Commissioner of Inland Revenue (NZ) (2004) .....	557
Accent Management Ltd v Commissioner of Inland Revenue (NZ) (2007) .....	557, 563
Accounting Systems 2000 (Developments) Pty Ltd v CCH Australia Ltd (1993) ....	322, 324
Actors and Announcers Equity Association of Australia v Fontana Films Pty Ltd (1982) .....	139
Agar v Hyde (2000) .....	273
Agricultural and Rural Finance Pty Ltd v Atkinson (2006) .	579, 584, 585, 606, 621-623
Air Great Lakes Pty Ltd v KS Easter (Holdings) Pty Ltd (1985) .....	567
Airlines of NSW Pty Ltd v New South Wales [No 2] (1965) .....	150, 181
Airservices Australia v Canadian Airlines International Ltd (2000) .....	130
AK v Western Australia (2008) .....	239
Alan (WJ) & Co Ltd v El Nasr Export & Import Co (1972) .....	587
Alcock v Fergie (1867) .....	40
Amaca Pty Ltd v Frost (2006) .....	273, 275, 276
Amalgamated Society of Engineers v Adelaide Steamship Co Ltd (Engineers' Case) (1920) .....	117, 118, 142, 145, 146, 184
AN v The Queen [No 2] (2006) .....	244
Anderson v The Commonwealth (1932) .....	34, 138
Angel v HH Bushell & Co Ltd (1967) .....	479
Anthony Hordern & Sons Ltd v Amalgamated Clothing and Allied Trades Union of Australia (1932) .....	410, 500, 502, 503, 506
Antonovic v Volker (1986) .....	604
APLA Ltd v Legal Services Commissioner (NSW) (2005) .....	407
Appellant S395/2002 v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (2003) ..	666
Applicant NAFF of 2002 v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2004) .....	636
Applicant VEAL of 2002 v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2005) .....	455, 458
Arab News Network v Al Khazen (2001) .....	481
Ascot Investments Pty Ltd v Harper (1981) .....	390, 391, 411, 425, 446
Ashton, In Marriage of (1986) .....	388, 433
Atlantic Star, The (1973) .....	277
Attorney-General v Observer Ltd (1988) .....	456
Attorney-General (Cth); Ex rel McKinlay v The Commonwealth (1975) .....	139
Attorney-General (NSW) v Brewery Employees' Union (NSW) (1908) .....	141, 145
Attorney-General (Vic) v The Commonwealth (Clothing Factory Case) (1935) .....	45

Attorney-General (Vic) v The Commonwealth (Pharmaceutical Benefits Case) (1945) .....	43, 46-51, 53-55, 60, 61, 73, 74, 81, 82, 92, 99, 103, 106, 112-114, 116, 124, 170, 196, 197, 201, 202, 210, 213-215
Attorney-General (WA) v Australian National Airlines Commission (1976) .....	150
Attorney-General (Vic); Ex rel Black v The Commonwealth (1981) ...	35, 196
Atwill v Commissioner of Stamp Duties (NSW) (1970) .....	444
Atwill v Commissioner of Stamp Duties (NSW) (1971) .....	444
Auckland Harbour Board v The Queen (1923) .....	38
Aussie Vic Plant Hire Pty Ltd v Esanda Finance Corporation Ltd (2007) .	237
Aussie Vic Plant Hire Pty Ltd v Esanda Finance Corporation Ltd (2008) .....	235-237
Austin v The Commonwealth (2003) .....	118
Australasian Memory Pty Ltd v Brien (2000) .....	361
Australian Alliance Assurance Co Ltd v Goodwyn (Insurance Commissioner) (1916) .....	41
Australian Boot Trade Employees Federation v Whybrow & Co (1910) ...	141
Australian Capital Television Pty Ltd v The Commonwealth (1992) .....	418
Australian Communist Party v The Commonwealth (Communist Party Case) (1951) .....	24, 89, 90, 103, 123, 125, 146, 147, 170, 178, 193, 195
Australian Conservation Foundation v The Commonwealth (1979) .....	68, 138
Australian Elizabethan Theatre Trust, Re (1991) .....	390
Australian National Airways Pty Ltd v The Commonwealth (1945) .....	144
Australian Securities and Investments Commission v Carey [No 6] (2006) .....	397, 408, 418
Australian Tape Manufacturers Association Ltd v The Commonwealth (1993) .....	130
Australian Woollen Mills Pty Ltd v The Commonwealth (1954) .	40, 46, 202, 203
Autodesk Inc v Dyason [No 2] (1993) .....	244
Backoffice Investments v Campbell (2007) .	309, 323-327, 329, 330, 332, 337, 338, 344, 346, 347, 349, 350, 353-355, 358
Bacon v Purcell (1916) .....	587
Bakewell v The Queen [No 2] (2008) .....	295
Bakewell v The Queen [No 3] (2008) .....	291
Baldwin v Commissioner of Inland Revenue (1964) .....	444
Balenzuela v De Gail (1959) .....	485
Bank of New South Wales v The Commonwealth (1948) .....	93, 131, 139
Bankruptcy, Official Receiver in v Schultz (1990) .....	394
Banner Industrial and Commercial Properties Ltd v Clark Paterson Ltd (1990) .....	617
Banning v Wright (1972) .....	616
Barker v Wingo (1972) .....	602, 616
Barrell Enterprises, In re (1973) .....	235
Barton v The Commonwealth (1974) .....	44, 61, 62, 116, 136, 185, 186, 199
Bateman Television Ltd v Coleridge Finance Co Ltd (1969) .....	557
Bateman's Bay Local Aboriginal Land Council v Aboriginal Community Benefit Fund Pty Ltd (1998) .....	35, 68, 138
Batistatos v Roads and Traffic Authority (NSW) (2006) .....	273
Baxter v Commissioners of Taxation (NSW) (1907) .....	84, 141, 144

## TABLE OF CASES CITED

xiii

Baxter v Obacelo Pty Ltd (2001) .....	588, 589
Beach Petroleum NL v Johnson (1993) .....	326
Beatty, In re (1990) .....	426
Beneficial Finance Corporation Ltd v Karavas (1991) .....	604
Berkoff v Burchill (1996) .....	477
Besseler Waechter Glover & Co v South Derwent Coal Co Ltd (1937) ....	597
Betfair Pty Ltd v Western Australia (2008) .....	125
Blood v Blood (1901) .....	409, 446
Bodruddaza v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (2007) .	558
Boilermakers' Case (R v Kirby; Ex parte Boilermakers' Society of Australia) (1956) .....	115, 118
Bosworthick v Bosworthick (1926) .....	438
Boyd v Mirror Newspapers Ltd (1980) .....	467, 473
Bridge v Campbell Discount Co Ltd (1962) .....	553
Bridgewater Navigation Co, In re (1891) .....	542
British American Oil Co v Ferguson (1950) .....	616, 621
British American Tobacco Australia Ltd v Western Australia (2003) ...	93, 133
Bronfman Trust v The Queen (1987) .....	556
Brook's Settlement Trusts, In re; Lloyds Bank Ltd v Tillard (1939) .	417, 423, 424
Brooks v Brooks (1995) .....	400, 401, 429, 437, 438, 440
Bropho v Western Australia (1990) .....	558
Brown v West (1990) .....	195, 209
Bruner v Moore (1903) .....	597
Buckley v Valeo (1976) .....	112
Burke v Dawes (1938) .....	390
Burns v Ransley (1949) .....	50, 171, 177
Burrell v The Queen (2007) .....	220, 227
Butcher v Lachlan Elder Realty Pty Ltd (2004) .....	319, 320, 341, 348
Buttigieg v Universal Terminal and Stevedoring Corporation (1972) .....	279
Byrne v Deane (1937) .....	478
C v C (2004) .....	436, 438
Cakmak v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2003) .....	257
Calvin v Carr (1979) .....	246
Cam & Sons Pty Ltd v Chief Secretary (NSW) (1951) .....	132
Campbell v BackOffice Investments Pty Ltd (2008) ..	309, 313-316, 327, 328, 332, 333, 338, 350, 351, 355, 358
Campomar Sociedad Limitada v Nike International Ltd (2000) .....	319, 341
Capital & Counties Bank v George Henty & Sons (1882) .....	467
Cassey v Stewart (1999) .....	616
CDJ v VAJ (1998) .....	248
Central London Property Trust Ltd v High Trees House Ltd (1946) .....	597
Chakravarti v Advertiser Newspapers Ltd (1998) .....	467
Chan v Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs (1989) .....	666
Charles C Steward Machine Co v Davis (1937) .....	112
Charles Rickards Ltd v Oppenheim (1950) .....	596, 597
CIC Insurance Ltd v Bankstown Football Club Ltd (1997) .....	440, 552, 651, 664, 668, 669

Clothing Factory Case (Attorney-General (Vic) v The Commonwealth) (1935) .....	45
Clough v Leahy (1904) .....	60, 503
Codelfa Construction Pty Ltd v State Rail Authority (NSW) (1982) .....	359
Cole v Whitfield (1988) .....	75, 106, 148, 149
Coleman, In re; Henry v Strong (1888) .....	417
Combet v The Commonwealth (2005) .....	53, 70, 78, 82, 103-105
Commonwealth, The v Australian Commonwealth Shipping Board (1926) .....	198
Commonwealth, The v Cigamic Pty Ltd (In liq) (1962) .....	85
Commonwealth, The v Colonial Ammunition Co Ltd (1924) ..	39, 44, 80, 204, 210, 211
Commonwealth, The v Colonial Combing, Spinning and Weaving Co Ltd (Wool Tops Case) (1922) .....	44, 83-85, 115, 136, 183-185, 194, 198
Commonwealth, The v John Fairfax & Sons Ltd (1980) .....	455
Commonwealth, The v SCI Operations Pty Ltd (1998) .....	31, 66, 155, 361
Commonwealth, The v Tasmania (Tasmanian Dam Case) (1983) .....	136, 139, 142, 163, 164, 172-176, 178, 181, 182, 191, 193
Commonwealth, The v Verwayen (1990) .....	587-590, 599-601, 605, 611-619
Commonwealth, The v Western Australia (1999) .....	86
Communist Party Case (Australian Communist Party v The Commonwealth) (1951) .....	24, 89, 90, 103, 123, 125, 146, 147, 170, 178, 193, 195
Company, In re a (1983) .....	361
Connor v Pukerau Store Ltd (1981) .....	602, 616
Cooper Brookes (Wollongong) Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1981) .....	558, 651, 656
Cooper v Commissioner of Income Tax (Qld) (1907) .....	141
Cornwell v The Queen (2007) .....	239
Corrs Pavey Whiting & Byrne v Collector of Customs (Vic) (1987) .....	456
Coulton v Holcombe (1986) .....	354
CPT Custodian Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) (2005) ..	387, 408
Craine v Colonial Mutual Fire Insurance Co Ltd (1920) ..	588, 589, 612, 613, 615, 618, 620
Cramas Properties Ltd v Connaught Fur Trimmings Ltd (1965) .....	651
Craven v White (1988) .....	555
Cridland v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1977) .....	548
Croome v Tasmania (1997) .....	35, 68
Crown Lands Act, Minister Administering v NSW Aboriginal Land Council (2008) .....	445
CSR Ltd v Della Maddalena (2006) .....	328
CTM v The Queen (2008) .....	241
Curran v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1974) .....	558
Customs, Collector of v Agfa-Gevaert Ltd (1996) .....	606
D'Orta-Ekenaike v Victoria Legal Aid (2005) .....	223
Dainford Ltd v Smith (1985) .....	503
Dalley (M) & Co Pty Ltd v Sims (1968) .....	360
Davidson [No 2], In Marriage of (1990) .....	388, 433
Davis v The Commonwealth (1988) .....	44, 52, 60, 62, 63, 84, 87, 90-92, 103, 116, 124, 136, 171, 172, 174-178, 182, 189, 191, 199

TABLE OF CASES CITED

xv

De Gruchy v The Queen (2002) .....	229
De L v Director-General, NSW Department of Community Services (1996) .....	159
De L v Director-General, NSW Department of Community Services [No 2] (1997) .....	244, 412
Deakin v Webb (1904) .....	141
Demagogue Pty Ltd v Ramensky (1992) .....	326
Dewar v Dewar (1960) .....	401, 438-440, 443
Dey v Victorian Railways Commissioners (1949) .....	273
Dillon v Baltic Shipping Co (The Mikhail Lermontov) (1989) .....	604
Dingjan, Re; Ex parte Wagner (1995) .....	93, 131
Disputant (TRA No 98/055) v Commissioner of Inland Revenue (2005) ..	562
Distillers Co (Biochemicals) Ltd v Thompson (1971) .....	272
DJL v Central Authority (2000) .....	223, 225, 226, 228, 240, 246, 248
DMW v CGW (1982) .....	222
Dormer v Ward (1900) .....	409, 435
Dougherty v Dougherty (1987) .....	387
Dow Jones & Co Inc v Gutnick (2002) .....	274
Drummond-Jackson v British Medical Association (1970) .....	469, 475, 481
Duff, In Marriage of (1977) .....	387, 397, 398
Eastman v The Queen (2000) .....	187
Ebrahimi v Westbourne Galleries Ltd (1972) .....	360, 399
Elder v Elder & Watson Ltd (1951) .....	331
Elder's Trustee and Executor Co Ltd v Commonwealth Homes and Investment Co Ltd (1941) .....	588
Electronic Industries Ltd v David Jones Ltd (1954) .....	592, 597-599
Ellenborough, In re (1902) .....	417
Elliott v The Queen (2007) .....	223, 225
Embrey v Earp (1890) .....	587
Engineers' Case (Amalgamated Society of Engineers v Adelaide Steamship Co Ltd) (1920) .....	117, 118, 142, 145, 146, 184
Enrico Furst & Co v WE Fischer Ltd (1960) .....	587
Equity Access Pty Ltd v Westpac Banking Corporation (1989) .....	342
Equuscop Pty Ltd v Glengallan Investments Pty Ltd (2001) .....	559
Equuscop Pty Ltd v Glengallan Investments Pty Ltd (2004) .....	531, 546, 558-560, 563, 564
Evans v Public Trustee (WA) (1991) .....	394
Express Newspapers Plc v News (UK) Ltd (1990) .....	590
F, Re; Ex parte F (1986) .....	131
FAI Insurances Ltd v Winneke (1982) .....	90
Fairfax v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1965) .....	129-131, 154
Fairfax (John) Publications Pty Ltd v Gacic (2007) .	467, 468, 472, 473, 476, 478, 486
Faraggi v The Queen (2008) .....	556
Farah Constructions Pty Ltd v Say-Dee Pty Ltd (2007) .....	161, 244
Farey v Burvett (1916) .....	60, 144
Favell v Queensland Newspapers Pty Ltd (2005) .....	467

Federated Amalgamated Government Railway and Tramway Service Association v New South Wales Railway Traffic Employees Association (1906) .....	141, 143
Fencott v Muller (1983) .....	407
Finagrain SA Geneva v P Kruse Hamburg (1976) .....	587
Fish v Solution 6 Holdings Ltd (2006) .....	558
Fishwick v Cleland (1960) .....	34, 138
Fitzgerald v Penn (1954) .....	313
Foran v Wight (1989) .....	612
Fountain v Alexander (1982) .....	440
Fox v Percy (2003) .....	328, 625
Frank Lyon Co v United States (1978) .....	551, 552
Fraser v NRMA Holdings Ltd (1995) .....	326
Furniss v Dawson (1984) .....	555
Gacic v John Fairfax Publications Pty Ltd (2006) .....	470-476, 478, 480, 483
Gamser v Nominal Defendant (1977) .....	228
Gange v Sullivan (1966) .....	587
Garcia v National Australia Bank Ltd (1998) .....	244
Gardiner v Agricultural and Rural Finance Pty Ltd (2007) .	579-581, 583, 603, 604, 607, 621, 622
Gardiner v John Fairfax & Sons Pty Ltd (1942) .....	475, 478
Gartside v Inland Revenue Commissioners (1967) .....	393, 415-419
General Motors Acceptance Corporation Australia v Southbank Traders Pty Ltd (2007) .....	558
General Steel Industries Inc v Commissioner for Railways (NSW) (1964) .....	273
Ghasemian v Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) (2003) ...	662
Gilbert J McCaul (Aust) Pty Ltd v Pitt Club Ltd (1956) .....	585
Gilchrist, Ex parte; In re Armstrong (1886) .....	426
Giumelli v Giumelli (1999) .....	590
Glencore Grain Ltd v Flacker Shipping Ltd (The Happy Day) (2002) ....	588, 615, 617, 624
Glenn v Federal Commissioner of Land Tax (1915) ..	386, 387, 417, 422, 424
Goodwin, In Marriage of (1990) .....	389, 433
Gould v Vaggelas (1984) .....	351
Grain Pool (WA) v The Commonwealth (2000) .....	102, 138, 188
Grannall v C Geo Kellaway & Sons Pty Ltd (1955) .....	301
Grannall v Marrickville Margarine Pty Ltd (1955) .....	120
Gregory v Helvering (1935) .....	551
Grey v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1939) .....	427
Grierson v The King (1938) .....	225, 226, 231, 242-249
Grundt v Great Boulder Pty Gold Mines Ltd (1937) .....	588, 593
H Jones & Co Pty Ltd v Kingborough Corporation (1950) .....	656
Hadjiloucas v Crean (1987) .....	531, 532
Haig v Minister Administering National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974 [No 2] (1994) .....	240
Hardie (James) & Coy Pty Ltd v Hall (1998) .....	273, 275
Hardie (James) Industries Pty Ltd v Grigor (1998) .....	273, 275

## TABLE OF CASES CITED

xvii

Hargreaves v Hargreaves (1926) .....	439
Harrison's Settlement, In re (1954) .....	235
Hartley v Hymans (1920) .....	588, 594
Hauff, In Marriage of (1986) .....	394
Hawke v Edwards (1947) .....	531
Health Insurance Commission v Peverill (1994) .....	66, 155
Helvering v Davis (1937) .....	112
Hickman v Haynes (1875) .....	594
Hicks v Gardner (1837) .....	609
Holford v Melbourne Tramway & Omnibus Co Ltd (1907) .....	485
Horta v The Commonwealth (1994) .....	159
House v The King (1936) .....	272, 285, 405
Hoyt's Pty Ltd v Spencer (1919) .....	531
HR Harmer Ltd, Re (1959) .....	360
Huddart, Parker & Co Pty Ltd v Moorehead (1909) .....	141, 145, 146
Hyman v Rose (1912) .....	243
Idlecroft Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (2005) .....	539, 540
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v Sok (2008) .....	258-260
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v SZKTI (2009) .....	510, 512
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v SZLFX (2008) .....	510, 512
Immigration and Citizenship, Minister for v SZLFX (2009) .....	492, 493, 504
Immigration and Ethnic Affairs, Minister for v Guo (1997) .....	666
Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for v Bhardwaj (2002) .....	246
Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for v Eshetu (1999) .....	497
Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for v Farahanipour (2001) .....	649, 662
Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for v Khawar (2002) .....	651
Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for v Mohammed (2000) .....	649, 662
Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for v Wang (2003) .....	402
Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, Minister for, Re; Ex parte Miah (2001) .....	636
Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs, Minister for v Nystrom (2006) .....	410, 502
Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs, Minister for v QAAH of 2004 (2006) .....	499
Inco Europe Ltd v First Choice Distribution (2000) .....	652
Incorporation Case (New South Wales v The Commonwealth) (1990) .	75, 143
Industrial Relations Act Case (Victoria v The Commonwealth) (1996) .	69, 93, 127, 131, 132, 159, 162-165, 188
Inland Revenue Commissioners v Burmah Oil Co Ltd (1981) .....	555
Inland Revenue Commissioners v Dempster (2008) .....	554
Inland Revenue Commissioners v National Federation of Self-Employed & Small Businesses Ltd (1981) .....	138
Internal Revenue, Commissioner of v Brown (1965) .....	551
Internal Revenue, Commissioner of v Court Holding Co (1945) .....	552
Investors Compensation Scheme Ltd v West Bromwich Building Society [No 1] (1997) .....	561
Jackamarra v Krakouer (1998) .....	236



Jacobs v Jacobs (1942) .....	435, 436
James Hardie & Coy Pty Ltd v Hall (1998) .....	273, 275
James Hardie Industries Pty Ltd v Grigor (1998) .....	273, 275
James Miller & Partners Ltd v Whitworth Street Estates (Manchester) Ltd (1970) .....	582, 607
Jaques v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1923) .....	559, 564
JEL v DDF (2001) .....	433
Jermyn Street Turkish Baths Ltd, In re (1970) .....	361
Jervis v Berridge (1873) .....	567
JJ Savage & Sons Pty Ltd v Blakney (1970) .....	321
John Fairfax Publications Pty Ltd v Gacic (2007) ....	467, 468, 472, 473, 476, 478, 486
John Pfeiffer Pty Ltd v Rogerson (2000) .....	280
John v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1989) .....	280, 555, 558
Johnson Matthey Bankers Ltd v State Trading Corporation of India Ltd (1984) .....	596
Johnson v Agnew (1979) .....	596
Johnson v Kent (1975) .....	44
Johnson v Zerbst (1938) .....	602, 616
Jones v Jones (1916) .....	479
Jones v Skinner (1835) .....	387, 388
Jones v The Queen (1989) .....	239, 245, 247
Jonesco v Beard (1930) .....	242
Joss v Joss (1942) .....	429, 439
Joyce v Sengupta (1992) .....	469
Juilliard v Greenman (Legal Tender Cases) (1884) .....	144
Jumbunna Coal Mine NL v Victorian Coal Miners' Association (1908) .....	138-140, 142, 143, 186, 204, 207, 212
K & S Lake City Freighters Pty Ltd v Gordon & Gotch Ltd (1985) .....	669
Kable v Director of Public Prosecutions (NSW) (1996) .....	292, 302
Kain v Hutton (2008) .....	408
Kelly [No 2], In Marriage of (1981) .....	388, 398
Ker v Wauchope (1819) .....	617
Kingston v Ke prose Pty Ltd (1987) .....	558
Knight v FP Special Assets Ltd (1992) .....	243
Knight, In Marriage of (1987) .....	401, 429
Koowarta v Bjelke-Petersen (1982) .....	139, 161
Kumar v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2007) .....	450
L Shaddock & Associates Pty Ltd v Parramatta City Council [No 2] (1982) .....	224
Lake (K & S) City Freighters Pty Ltd v Gordon & Gotch Ltd (1985) .....	669
Lange v Australian Broadcasting Corporation (1997) .....	38, 139, 176
Langley v Langley (1892) .....	409
Lansell v Lansell (1964) .....	401, 440
Lawrence v Texas (2003) .....	189
Laws v Rutherford (1924) .....	616
Le Mesurier v Connor (1929) .....	215
Leask v The Commonwealth (1996) .....	157

TABLE OF CASES CITED

xix

Lee v Wilson & Mackinnon (1934) .....	466, 476
Leeds & Hanley Theatre of Varieties v Broadbent (1898) .....	609
Leigh’s Will Trusts, In re (1969) .....	418
Leon Fink Holdings Pty Ltd v Australian Film Commission (1979) .	410, 503
L’Estrange v F Graucob Ltd (1934) .....	348
Lewis v Daily Telegraph Ltd (1963) .....	467, 481
Lezam Pty Ltd v Seabridge Australia Pty Ltd (1992) .....	342
Libke v The Queen (2007) .....	241
Lipohar v The Queen (1999) .....	297
Lissenden v CAV Bosch Ltd (1940) .....	588, 589
Liversidge v Anderson (1941) .....	134
Livingston v Commissioner of Stamp Duties (Qld) (1960) .....	393
Lock v Westpac Banking Corporation (1991) .....	386
Logan Downs Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1965) ....	34, 138
London School of Electronics Ltd, In re (1985) .....	361
Luton v Lessels (2002) .....	130
M Dalley & Co Pty Ltd v Sims (1968) .....	360
Mackay v Dick (1881) .....	358, 599
Macks, Re; Ex parte Saint (2000) .....	222, 407
MacNiven v Westmoreland Investments Ltd (2001) .....	554
Mallinson v Scottish Australian Investment Co Ltd (1920) .....	31, 66
Mann v Carnell (1999) .....	587
Marac Finance Ltd v Virtue (1981) .....	563
Marac Life Assurance Ltd v Commissioner of Inland Revenue (NZ) (1986) .....	557, 563
Marbury v Madison (1803) .....	144
Marc Rich & Co AG v Portman (1995) .....	620
Marc Rich & Co AG v Portman (1996) .....	620
March v E & MH Stramare Pty Ltd (1991) .....	313
Marchischuk v Dominion Industrial Supplies Ltd (1991) .....	616
Mardorf Peach & Co Ltd v Attica Sea Carriers Corporation of Liberia (1977) .....	581, 602, 624
Martin v Hunter’s Lessee (1816) .....	143
Massachusetts v Mellon (1923) .....	34
Maye, In re (2008) .....	418
McClurg v Minister of National Revenue (1990) .....	556
McCulloch v Maryland (1819) .....	120, 130, 144
McGinty v Western Australia (1996) .....	139, 187
McPhail v Doulton (1970) .....	408
Melbourne Corporation v The Commonwealth (1947) ..	86, 91, 115, 118, 120, 153
Melvill v Melvill (1930) .....	439
Micklethwait v Micklethwait (1858) .....	437
Milankov, In Marriage of (2002) .....	433
Milas v Labor Association of Wisconsin, Inc (1997) .....	616
Mills v Dowdall (1983) .....	557
Minnesota v United States (1939) .....	390
Mirror Newspapers Ltd v World Hosts Pty Ltd (1979) .....	466, 467, 469, 476
Mohammed v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (1999) .	662

Molloy v Federal Commissioner of Land Tax (1937) .....	390
Moore v The Commonwealth (1951) .....	94
Motor Oil Hellas (Corinth) Refineries SA v Shipping Corporation of India (The Kanchenjunga) (1990) .....	587
Muir v Muir (1943) .....	427
Mulcahy v Hoyne (1925) .....	587
Mullane v Mullane (1983) .....	400
Mutual Pools & Staff Pty Ltd v The Commonwealth (1994) .....	94, 130, 154, 156
MZXBQ v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2008) .....	514
NAIS v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2005) .....	636
National Provincial Bank Ltd v Ainsworth (1965) .....	418
National Revenue, Minister of v Cameron (1972) .....	555
National Revenue, Minister of v Leon (1977) .....	555
Native Title Act Case (Western Australia v The Commonwealth) (1995) ....	94
Neilson v Overseas Projects Corporation of Victoria Ltd (2005) .....	280
Nevill v Fine Art & General Insurance Co Ltd (1896) .....	467
New South Wales Medical Defence Union Ltd v Crawford [No 3] (1994) .....	240
New South Wales v Bardolph (1934) .....	39, 40, 60
New South Wales v The Commonwealth (Incorporation Case) (1990) .	75, 143
New South Wales v The Commonwealth (Seas and Submerged Lands Case) (1975) .....	44, 170
New South Wales v The Commonwealth (Surplus Revenue Case) (1908) .	43, 44, 52, 72, 73, 91, 104, 210, 211
New South Wales v The Commonwealth (Work Choices Case) (2006) ....	117, 118, 141, 142, 146, 157
New South Wales v The Commonwealth [No 1] (1932) .....	40
Newcastle City Council v GIO General Ltd (1997) .....	552
Neylon v Dickens (1978) .....	616
Nguyen v Nguyen (1990) .....	244
Northern Suburbs General Cemetery Reserve Trust v The Commonwealth (1993) .....	38, 40, 52, 55, 130, 205
Northern Territory v Mengel (1995) .....	614
Nova Scotia Steel Co Ltd v Sutherland Steam Shipping Co Ltd (1899) ...	608
O'Connor v SP Bray Ltd (1936) .....	588, 589
O'Grady v Wilmot (1916) .....	386, 427
Oakey Abattoir Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1984) .	557, 562
Oceanic Sun Line Special Shipping Co Inc v Fay (1988) .	277, 281, 283, 614
Ogle v Earl Vane (1867) .....	595
Ogle v Earl Vane (1868) .....	592, 595, 596
Oliver Ashworth (Holdings) Ltd v Ballard (Kent) Ltd (1999) ..	585, 589, 605, 612, 613, 617, 619
Onus v Alcoa of Australia Ltd (1981) .....	138
Osland v Secretary, Department of Justice (2008) .....	587, 611, 620
Owendale Pty Ltd v Anthony (1966) .....	588
Paintin and Nottingham Ltd v Miller Gale and Winter (1970) ..	544, 551, 556

## TABLE OF CASES CITED

xxi

Palmer Bruyn & Parker Pty Ltd v Parsons (2001) .....	469
Panoutsos v Raymond Hadley Corporation of New York (1917) .....	592, 596, 597, 599, 600, 612, 615
Pantorno v The Queen (1989) .....	225, 226, 247
Papua and New Guinea, Administration of v Daera Guba (1973) .....	582
Parkdale Custom Built Furniture Pty Ltd v Puxu Pty Ltd (1982) .....	319
Parmiter v Coupland (1840) .....	466
Pearse v Pearse (1846) .....	236
Pearson v Inland Revenue Commissioners (1980) .....	416
Perlman v Perlman (1984) .....	440
Permanent Trustee Australia Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (Vic) (2004) .....	70
Perpetual Trustee Co Ltd v Commissioner of Stamp Duties (NSW) (1941) .....	390
Peterswald v Bartley (1904) .....	141
Pfeiffer (John) Pty Ltd v Rogerson (2000) .....	280
Pfizer Corporation v Ministry of Health (1965) .....	78
Pharmaceutical Benefits Case (Attorney-General (Vic) v The Commonwealth) (1945) .....	43, 46-51, 53-55, 60, 61, 73, 74, 81, 82, 92, 99, 103, 106, 112-114, 116, 124, 170, 196, 197, 201, 202, 210, 213-215
Phillips v Ellinson Bros Pty Ltd (1941) .....	594
Pidoto v Victoria (1943) .....	131, 132
Pitcher Products Pty Ltd v Country Roads Board (1964) .....	653
Pittalis v Sherefettin (1986) .....	235
Plaintiff S157/2002 v The Commonwealth (2003) .....	69, 497
Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v Casey (1992) .....	189
Plevins v Downing (1876) .....	597
PMT Partners Pty Ltd (In liq) v Australian National Parks and Wildlife Service (1995) .....	440
Polyukhovich v The Commonwealth (1991) .....	157, 159
Port MacDonnell Professional Fishermens Association Inc v South Australia (1989) .....	139
Postiglione v The Queen (1997) .....	225, 226, 228, 246
Potts v Moran (1976) .....	478
Prescott v Fellowes (1958) .....	438
Price v Dyer (1810) .....	587
Pridmore v Magenta Nominees Pty Ltd (1999) .....	588
Princep v Princep (1929) .....	437, 446
Project Blue Sky Inc v Australian Broadcasting Authority (1998) ....	440, 443, 444, 497, 552, 558, 637, 664
Public Prosecutions, Director of v Bakewell (2007) .....	291
Public Prosecutions, Director of v United Telecasters Sydney Ltd (1990) .	543
Puttick v Fletcher Challenge Forests Ltd (2006) .....	270-272, 276, 283
Puttick v Fletcher Challenge Forests Pty Ltd (2007) .	270, 272, 273, 276, 284
Pye v Renshaw (1951) .....	138
Queensland v The Commonwealth (1977) .....	209
Queensland v JL Holdings Pty Ltd (1997) .....	236
R & I Bank of Western Australia Ltd v Anchorage Investments Pty Ltd (1993) .....	417

R v Allen (1994) .....	244
R v Barger (1908) .....	117, 130, 141, 145
R v Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate; Ex parte Pinochet Ugarte [No 2] (1999) .....	223, 244
R v Brown (1996) .....	606
R v Burgess; Ex parte Henry (1936) .....	164
R v Burrell (2007) .....	221, 222, 227, 231, 243
R v Carrion (2002) .....	244
R v Coldham; Ex parte Australian Social Welfare Union (1983) .....	139
R v Commonwealth Conciliation and Arbitration Commission; Ex parte Association of Professional Engineers, Australia (1959) .....	176
R v Commonwealth Court of Conciliation and Arbitration; Ex parte Whybrow & Co (1910) .....	131, 132
R v Dovey; Ex parte Ross (1979) .....	392
R v Duncan; Ex parte Australian Iron and Steel Pty Ltd (1983) .....	63, 177
R v Giri [No 2] (2001) .....	245
R v Gust (2000) .....	245, 248
R v Hughes (2000) .....	63, 87, 93, 133, 136, 177, 191
R v Inland Revenue Commissioners; Ex parte Matrix Securities Ltd (1994) .....	545
R v Kirby; Ex parte Boilermakers' Society of Australia (Boilermakers' Case) (1956) .....	115, 118
R v Lapa [No 2] (1995) .....	245, 248
R v MA (2004) .....	238
R v McNamara [No 2] (1996) .....	248
R v Paulson (1920) .....	587
R v Petroulias (2005) .....	238
R v Pettigrew (1996) .....	245, 248
R v Poole; Ex parte Henry [No 2] (1939) .....	93, 131, 133
R v Public Vehicles Licensing Appeal Tribunal (Tas); Ex parte Australian National Airways Pty Ltd (1964) .....	102, 139
R v Reardon [No 2] (2004) .....	221, 248
R v Romeo (1996) .....	300
R v Saxon (1998) .....	245, 248
R v Sharkey (1949) .....	50, 161, 171, 177
R v Stephens (1990) .....	235
R v Toohey; Ex parte Meneling Station Pty Ltd (1982) .....	400, 418
R v Vasey (1905) .....	656
R v Wallis (1949) .....	410
R (Crown Prosecution Service) v Bow Street Magistrates' Court (2006) ..	652
R (Passenger Transport UK) v Humber Bridge Board (2003) .....	652
Radio 2UE Sydney Pty Ltd v Chesterton (2008) .....	474, 475, 477, 481
Radziej v Radziej (1967) .....	436
Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (2006) ..	521, 544-549, 553
Raftland Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (2007) .	521, 544, 549, 550, 564
Railways (NSW), Commissioner for v Agalianos (1955) .....	664
Ramsay (WT) Ltd v Inland Revenue Commissioners (1981) ....	554, 555, 558
Ratcliffe v Evans (1892) .....	469

Ravenor Overseas Inc v Readhead (1998) .....	244
Reader's Digest Services Pty Ltd v Lamb (1982) .....	466, 468, 477-480, 482
Real Estate Institute (NSW) v Blair (1946) .....	69
Refrigerated Express Lines (A/asia) Pty Ltd v Australian Meat and Livestock Corporation [No 2] (1980) .....	410
Refugee Review Tribunal, Re; Ex parte Aala (2000) .....	188, 636
Regie Nationale des Usines Renault SA v Zhang (2002) .....	272, 274, 280
Residential Tenancies Tribunal (NSW), Re; Ex parte Defence Housing Authority (1997) .....	83, 85, 86, 195
Reynolds, In re (1942) .....	541
Richard Walter Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1996) .....	538
Ridge v English Illustrated Magazine Ltd (1913) .....	480
Road Accident Fund v Mothupi (2000) .....	616, 620, 621
Roads and Traffic Authority v Royal (2008) .....	565
Roebuck v Mungovin (1994) .....	591
Ronald v Harper (1913) .....	242
Rosenberg v Percival (2001) .....	353
Ruddock v Vadarlis (2001) .....	83
SAAP v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2005) .....	492, 497, 499-501, 513, 638, 639
Sainsbury v Inland Revenue Commissioners (1969) .....	393
Samuel, Re (1913) .....	79
Sanders v Sanders (1967) .....	401
Sargent v ASL Developments Ltd (1974) .....	588, 616
Saskatchewan River Bungalows Ltd v Maritime Life Assurance Co (1994) .....	602, 616, 620
Saulnier v Royal Bank of Canada WBLI Inc (2008) .....	397
Savage (JJ) & Sons Pty Ltd v Blakney (1970) .....	321
Schaverian v Morris (1921) .....	608
Schmidt v Rosewood Trust Ltd (2003) .....	408, 417, 418
Scott v Federal Commissioner of Taxation [No 2] (1966) .....	531, 553, 560
Scott-Chisholme v Brown (1893) .....	610
Scottish Co-operative Wholesale Society Ltd v Meyer (1958) .....	331, 361
Seas and Submerged Lands Case (New South Wales v The Commonwealth) (1975) .....	44, 170
Secured Income Real Estate (Australia) Ltd v St Martins Investments Pty Ltd (1979) .....	358
Sharrment Pty Ltd v Official Trustee in Bankruptcy (1988) .....	531, 546, 553, 554, 559, 562
Shepherd v Hills (1855) .....	31, 65, 66, 155
Shi v Migration Agents Registration Authority (2008) .....	243
Shin Kobe Maru, Owners of v Empire Shipping Co Inc (1994) .	361, 439, 669
Shop, Distributive and Allied Employees Association v Minister for Industrial Affairs (SA) (1995) .....	138
Sim v Stretch (1936) .....	466, 467, 475, 477
Sinclair v Lee (1993) .....	542
Singh v The Commonwealth (2004) .....	75
Slatyer v Daily Telegraph Newspaper Co Ltd (1908) .....	466, 467, 477
Smee v Smee (1965) .....	401, 441

Smits v Roach (2006) .....	611
Snook v London and West Riding Investments Ltd (1967) .	531, 554-556, 562
Sok v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2007) .....	258
Somaghi v Minister for Immigration, Local Government and Ethnic Affairs (1991) .....	662, 664, 665, 667
South Australia v The Commonwealth (1942) .....	205
South Hetton Coal Co Ltd v North Eastern News Association Ltd (1893) .	469
Spiliada Maritime Corporation v Cansulex Ltd (1986) .....	281
St Nazaire Co, Re (1879) .....	242
Stack v Coast Securities (No 9) Pty Ltd (1983) .....	407
Stamp Duties (NSW), Chief Commissioner of v Buckle (1998) .....	386, 420
Stamp Duties (NSW), Commissioner of v Atwill (1972) .....	444
Stamp Duties (Qld), Commissioner of v Jolliffe (1920) .....	535
Stamp Duties (Qld), Commissioner of v Livingston (1964) .....	386, 393, 418
Stamps (SA), Commissioner of v Telegraph Investment Co Pty Ltd (1995) .....	76
State Public Services Federation, Re; Ex parte Attorney-General (WA) (1993) .....	553
State Rail Authority (NSW) v Codelfa Construction Pty Ltd (1982) .....	244
Stein, In Marriage of (1986) .....	433
Stephens v Stephens (2007) .....	382, 384, 396, 430-434
Stewart v The King (1921) .....	231
Stone (HM Inspector of Taxes) v Hitch (2001) .....	554, 555, 562, 563
Stoneleigh Finance v Phillips (1964) .....	554
Street v Mountford (1985) .....	555
Street v Queensland Bar Association (1989) .....	139
Strickland v Rocla Concrete Pipes Ltd (1971) .....	131, 132, 146
Stubart Investments Ltd v The Queen (1984) .....	554-556
Sue v Hill (1999) .....	76, 84
Sun Zhan Qui v Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs (1997) .....	497
Sungravure Pty Ltd v Middle East Airlines Airliban SAL (1975) .....	468, 469
Surplus Revenue Case (New South Wales v The Commonwealth) (1908) .	43, 44, 52, 72, 73, 91, 104, 210, 211
Suttor v Gundowda Pty Ltd (1950) .....	354, 428, 429, 445
Suvaal v Cessnock City Council (2003) .....	439
Sydney Municipal Council v The Commonwealth (1904) .....	141
SZAYW v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2006) .....	499
SZBEL v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2006) .....	261, 497, 499, 505
SZBYR v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2007) .....	513, 514, 639
SZGME v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2008) .....	259
SZIZO v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2008) .....	631, 635, 636, 640
SZIZO v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (2007) .....	633
SZJGV v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2008) .....	656, 660, 661, 664, 665
SZKLG v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2007) .....	514
SZKTI v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2007) .....	496
SZKTI v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2008) .	492, 496, 510-512

## TABLE OF CASES CITED

xxv

SZLFX v Minister for Immigration (2008) .....	511
SZLPO v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2009) .....	492
Taco Co of Australia Inc v Taco Bell Pty Ltd (1982) .....	342
Tallerman & Co Pty Ltd v Nathan's Merchandise (Vic) Pty Ltd (1957) ..	593, 594
Tang Man Sit v Capacious Investments Ltd (1995) .....	588
Tanwar Enterprises Pty Ltd v Cauchi (2003) .....	607
Tasmania v The Commonwealth and Victoria (1904) .....	140, 143
Tasmanian Dam Case (The Commonwealth v Tasmania) (1983) .....	136, 139, 142, 163, 164, 172-176, 178, 181, 182, 191, 193
Tatham v Huxtable (1950) .....	426, 427
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v CityLink Melbourne Ltd (2006) .....	558
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Ilbery (1981) .....	557
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Kelly Ford Pty Ltd (1984) .....	557
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Official Liquidator of EO Farley Ltd (1940) .....	48, 198
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Patcorp Investments Ltd (1974) .....	558
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Prestige Motors Pty Ltd (1998) .....	539
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Ramsden (2005) .....	416
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Ryan (2000) .....	558
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Spotless Services Ltd (1996) .	551, 552, 558
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Vegners (1989) .....	386, 420
Taxation, Federal Commissioner of v Westraders Pty Ltd (1980) .....	552, 553, 557
Telstra Corporation Ltd v The Commonwealth (2008) .....	558
Territorial Senators' Case (Western Australia v The Commonwealth) (1975) .....	139
Texas Co (Australasia) Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1940) ..	226
Thayanathan v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (2001) .....	259
Theophanous v Herald & Weekly Times Ltd (1994) .....	187
Thomas v Mowbray (2007) .....	88, 147, 159, 162, 172
Thorson v Attorney-General (Can) [No 2] (1974) .....	35, 138
Tofilau v The Queen (2007) .....	558
Tolley v JS Fry & Sons Ltd (1929) .....	466, 480, 481
Tournier v National Provincial & Union Bank of England (1923) .....	467
Tracey, Re; Ex parte Ryan (1989) .....	131
Trade Practices Commission v Lamova Publishing Corporation Pty Ltd (1979) .....	342
Tremayne v Rashleigh (1908) .....	427
Truong v The Queen (2004) .....	611
Truth About Motorways Pty Ltd v Macquarie Infrastructure Investment Management Ltd (2000) .....	68, 188
Tucker v Commissioner of Inland Revenue (1965) .....	444
Union Eagle Ltd v Golden Achievement Ltd (1997) .....	607
United Australia Ltd v Barclays Bank Ltd (1940) .....	589
United States v Butler (1936) .....	112
United States v Gerlach Live Stock Co (1950) .....	112



Upton v Brown (1879) .....	541
Upton v Brown (1884) .....	541, 542
Uren v John Fairfax & Sons Pty Ltd (1966) .....	466
Vacuum Oil Co Pty Ltd v Queensland [No 2] (1935) .....	131
Vakauta v Kelly (1989) .....	611
Vasiljkovic v The Commonwealth (2006) .....	87
Vass v The Commonwealth (2000) .....	40
Victoria v The Commonwealth (1926) .....	109
Victoria v The Commonwealth (Industrial Relations Act Case) (1996) .	69, 93, 127, 131, 132, 159, 162-165, 188
Victoria v The Commonwealth and Hayden (AAP Case) (1975) ...	34, 35, 46, 48-53, 55, 60, 61, 63, 70, 71, 73, 78, 80, 87, 103, 106, 111, 113, 114, 116, 117, 124, 138, 165, 170, 175-178, 181, 187, 189, 191, 195, 196, 198, 199, 202-208, 210-212, 214
Victorian Stevedoring & General Contracting Co Pty Ltd v Dignan (1931) .	38
Voth v Manildra Flour Mills Pty Ltd (1990) .....	271, 276, 277, 279-281, 283
Wachtel v Wachtel (1973) .....	442
Wakim, Re; Ex parte McNally (1999) .....	120
Walsh, Ex parte; Re Yates (1925) .....	170
Walter (Richard) Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1996) .....	538
Warner v Elders Rural Finance Ltd (1993) .....	326
Water Board v Moustakas (1988) .....	439, 445
Water Conservation and Irrigation Commission (NSW) v Browning (1947) .....	89, 90
Wayde v New South Wales Rugby League Ltd (1985) .....	331
Webster, In Marriage of (1998) .....	433
Webster, In re (1975) .....	79
Weiss v The Queen (2005) .....	239
West v AGC (Advances) Ltd (1986) .....	604
Western Australia v The Commonwealth (Native Title Act Case) (1995) ....	94
Western Australia v The Commonwealth (Territorial Senators' Case) (1975) .....	139
Whisprun Pty Ltd v Dixon (2003) .....	439
White v Director of Military Prosecutions (2007) .....	87
Wholesale Distributors Ltd v Gibbons Holdings Ltd (2007) .....	582
Wilson v Anderson (2002) .....	132
Winrobe Pty Ltd v Sundin's Building Co Pty Ltd [No 2] (1990) .....	240
WJ Alan & Co Ltd v El Nasr Export & Import Co (1972) .....	587
Wondoflex Textiles Pty Ltd, In re (1951) .....	360
Woods v Multi-Sport Holdings Pty Ltd (2002) .....	146
Wool Tops Case (The Commonwealth v Colonial Combing, Spinning and Weaving Co Ltd) (1922) .....	44, 83-85, 115, 136, 183-185, 194, 198
Work Choices Case (New South Wales v The Commonwealth) (2006) ....	117, 118, 141, 142, 146, 157
Worthing v Rowell and Muston Pty Ltd (1970) .....	87, 139
WT Ramsay Ltd v Inland Revenue Commissioners (1981) .....	554, 555, 558

TABLE OF CASES CITED

xxvii

XYZ v The Commonwealth (2006) .. 126, 139, 150, 159, 161, 162, 179, 188, 487

Yanner v Eaton (1999) ..... 397

Yenidje Tobacco Co Ltd, In re (1916) ..... 360

Yilmaz v Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (2000) ..... 259

Yorke v Lucas (1985) ..... 320

Yorkshire Railway Wagon Co v Maclure (1882) ..... 554

Yougarla v Western Australia (2001) ..... 79

Youssupoff v Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer Pictures Ltd (1934) ..... 467

Zhu v Treasurer (NSW) (2004) ..... 397

**Corrigendum**

**237 CLR 506, line 5:** For “*S J Gaegler SC*” read “*S J Gageler SC*”.

## Corrigendum

**237 CLR 506, line 5:** For “*S J Gaegler SC*” read “*S J Gageler SC*”.