

1920-1921.

THE

**COMMONWEALTH LAW
REPORTS**

CASES DETERMINED IN THE

HIGH COURT OF AUSTRALIA.

Editor—ALFRED H. HAYBALL, B.A., LL.B., *Barrister-at-Law.*

REPORTERS ·

<i>New South Wales</i>	· {	BENNETLANGTON, B.A., LL.B., <i>Barrister-at-Law.</i>
		NEIL McTAGUE, LL.B., <i>Barrister-at-Law.</i>
<i>Victoria</i>	· }	BENNET LANGTON, B.A., LL.B., <i>Barrister-at-Law.</i>
<i>South Australia</i>		
<i>Tasmania</i>		
<i>Queensland</i>		
<i>Western Australia</i>		

VOL. 29.

1920-1921—11 & 12 GEO. V.

Melbourne, Vic. :

**CHARLES F. MAXWELL,
LAW BOOKSELLER AND PUBLISHER,
425 CHANCERY LANE.**

JUSTICES OF THE HIGH COURT
OF AUSTRALIA

DURING THE CURRENCY OF THIS VOLUME.

THE RIGHT HONOURABLE ADRIAN KNOX, P.C., K.C.M.G., CHIEF
JUSTICE.

THE RIGHT HONOURABLE ISAAC ALFRED ISAACS, P.C.

THE HONOURABLE HENRY BOURNES HIGGINS.

THE HONOURABLE FRANK GAVAN DUFFY.

THE HONOURABLE CHARLES POWERS.

THE HONOURABLE GEORGE EDWARD RICH.

THE HONOURABLE HAYDEN ERSKINE STARKE.

ATTORNEY-GENERAL:

THE RIGHT HONOURABLE WILLIAM MORRIS HUGHES, P.C., M.P.

THE mode of citation of this volume of the COMMONWEALTH LAW REPORTS will be as follows:—

29 C.L.R.

A TABLE
OF THE
NAMES OF THE CASES REPORTED
IN THIS VOLUME.

A	PAGE		PAGE
Adelaide Steamship Co. Ltd., Amalgamated Society of En- gineers v. - - - - -	406	Attorney-General (Cth.), New- castle and Hunter River Steamship Co. Ltd. v. - - -	357
Adult Deaf and Dumb Society of Victoria, Nunawading Shire v. - - - - -	98	— v. State of Queensland and Commissioner of Income Tax (Qd.) - - - - -	1
Alexander v. Menary - - -	371	Australasian Films Ltd., R. v.	195
Alexander Stewart & Sons Ltd. v. Robinson [No. 1] - - -	55	Australian Metal Co. Ltd., <i>In re</i>	347
— v. — [No. 2] - - -	325	Australian Tramway Employees' Association, R. v. ; <i>Ex parte</i> North Melbourne Electric Tramways and Lighting Co. Ltd. - - - - -	106
Alliance Assurance Co. Ltd. v. Federal Commissioner of Tax- ation - - - - -	424		
Amalgamated Society of En- gineers v. Adelaide Steamship Co. Ltd. - - - - -	406	B	
Angas, Registrar of Probates (S.A.) v. - - - - -	477	Bennett (S.) Ltd., Wilkinson v.	283
		Blackie & Sons Ltd. v. Lothian Book Publishing Co Pro- prietary Ltd. - - - - -	396

	PAGE		PAGE
Broken Hill Proprietary Co. Ltd.,		Commissioner of Taxation	
<i>Ex parte</i> - - - -	290	(Federal), Union Steamship	
Buhlmann <i>v.</i> Nilsson - -	417	Co. of New Zealand Ltd. <i>v.</i>	84
Burnes, Willis <i>v.</i> - - -	511	(N.S.W.), Studebaker	
Butt <i>v.</i> John W. Eaton Ltd. -	126	Corporation of Australasia	
		Ltd. <i>v.</i> - - - -	225
C		(W.A.) <i>v.</i> Newman -	484
Carey, Lorenzo <i>v.</i> - - -	243	Commissioner of Taxes (Vict.)	
Carter <i>v.</i> E. W. Roach & J. B.		<i>v.</i> Lennon - - - -	579
Milton Proprietary Ltd. -	515	Commonwealth <i>v.</i> Commissioner	
Clark (James) & Co. <i>v.</i> Stang -	113	of Income Tax (Qd.) - -	1
Collector of Imposts (Vict.) <i>v.</i>		Cross <i>v.</i> - - - -	219
Peers - - - -	115	<i>v.</i> Hazeldell Ltd. -	448
Collingridge, Niesmann <i>v.</i> -	177	Lady Carrington	
Combes, Watkins <i>v.</i> - - -	317	Steamship Co. Ltd. <i>v.</i> -	596
Commercial Bank of Australia		Le Leu <i>v.</i> - - - -	305
Ltd., King <i>v.</i> - - - -	141	<i>v.</i> State of Queensland	1
Commissioner of Income Tax		Commonwealth Court of Con-	
(Qd.), Commonwealth and		ciliation and Arbitration, R.	
Attorney-General (Cth.) <i>v.</i> -	1	<i>v.</i> ; <i>Ex parte</i> North Melbourne	
Commissioner of Stamp Duties		Electric Tramways and Light-	
(N.S.W.), Vegetable Creek Tin		ing Co. Ltd. - - - -	106
Mining Co. No Liability <i>v.</i> -	414	Condogianis <i>v.</i> Guardian Assur-	
Commissioner of Taxation (De-		ance Co. Ltd. - - - -	341
puty Federal), Cornell <i>v.</i> -	39	Cornell <i>v.</i> Deputy Federal Com-	
(Deputy Federal) <i>v.</i>		missioner of Taxation (S.A.) -	39
Purcell - - - -	464	Crawford, McCullin <i>v.</i> - -	186
(Federal), Alliance As-		Cross <i>v.</i> Commonwealth - -	219
surance Co. Ltd. <i>v.</i> - -	424	Crown, Westralian Powell Wood	
(Federal), Forrest <i>v.</i> -	441	Process Ltd. <i>v.</i> - - - -	458
(Federal), Hoysted <i>v.</i> -	537	Customs (Minister for) <i>v.</i> Aus-	
(Federal), James Fen-		tralasian Films Ltd. - -	195
wick & Co. Ltd. <i>v.</i> - -	164		
(Federal), Murray <i>v.</i> -	134	D	
(Federal), Osborne <i>v.</i> -	169	Daly <i>v.</i> State of Victoria -	491
(Federal), Ramaciotti		Davies Bros. Ltd., Ryan <i>v.</i> -	527
<i>v.</i> - - - -	49		

	PAGE		PAGE
De Lauret & Co. Ltd., Whitfeld <i>v.</i>	71	Hoysted <i>v.</i> Federal Commissioner of Taxation - - - -	537
Deputy Federal Commissioner of Taxation. <i>See</i> Commissioner of Taxation.			
I			
		Imposts Collector (Vict.) <i>v.</i> Peers	115
		Income Tax Commissioner. <i>See</i> Commissioner of Income Tax.	
E.		Innes <i>v.</i> Lincoln Motor Co.	277
E. W. Roach & J. B. Milton Pro- prietary Ltd., Carter <i>v.</i> - -	515		
Eaton (John W.) Ltd., Butt <i>v.</i> -	126	J	
Edgar <i>v.</i> Licensing Court (Vict.)	321	James Clark & Co. <i>v.</i> Stang	113
Edwards <i>v.</i> Municipal Tramways Trust - - - -	129	James Fenwick & Co. Ltd. <i>v.</i> Federal Commissioner of Tax- ation - - - -	164
F			
Federal Commissioner of Taxa- tion. <i>See</i> Commissioner of Taxation.		John Heine & Son Ltd. <i>v.</i> Pickard - - - -	592
Fenwick (James) & Co. Ltd. <i>v.</i> Federal Commissioner of Tax- ation - - - -	164	John W. Eaton Ltd., Butt <i>v.</i> -	126
Fitzpatrick, Gleeson <i>v.</i> - -	29	Judiciary and Navigation Acts, <i>In re</i> - - - -	257
Forrest <i>v.</i> Federal Commissioner of Taxation - - - -	441	K	
G			
Geraghty, Presley <i>v.</i> - -	154	King <i>v.</i> Commercial Bank of Aus- tralia Ltd. - - - -	141
Gleeson <i>v.</i> Fitzpatrick - -	29	King, The. <i>See</i> R.	
Goldstein, Official Assignee <i>v.</i> -	377	Kronheimer, Roche <i>v.</i> - -	329
Guardian Assurance Co. Ltd., Condogianis <i>v.</i> - - - -	341	L	
H			
Hazeldell Ltd., Commonwealth <i>v.</i> - - - -	448	Lady Carrington Steamship Co. Ltd. <i>v.</i> Commonwealth - -	596
Heine (John) & Son Ltd. <i>v.</i> Pickard - - - -	592	Le Leu <i>v.</i> Commonwealth - -	305
Hibble, R. <i>v.</i> ; <i>Ex parte</i> Broken Hill Proprietary Co. Ltd. -	290	Lennon, Commissioner of Taxes (Vict.) <i>v.</i> - - - -	579
		----- <i>v.</i> Scarlett & Co. - -	499
		Licensing Court (Vict.), Edgar <i>v.</i>	321
		Lincoln Motor Co., Innes <i>v.</i> -	277
		Little, Wood <i>v.</i> - - - -	564
		Lorenzo <i>v.</i> Carey - - - -	243

	PAGE	P	PAGE
Lothian Book Publishing Co. Proprietary Ltd., Blackie & Sons Ltd. <i>v.</i> - - - -	396	Peers, Collector of Imposts (Vict.) <i>v.</i> - - - -	115
Luke <i>v.</i> Mayoh - - - -	435	Pickard, John Heine & Son Ltd. <i>v.</i> - - - -	592
M		Presley <i>v.</i> Geraghty - - - -	154
Mayoh, Luke <i>v.</i> - - - -	435	Public Officer of Studebaker Corporation of Australasia Ltd. <i>v.</i> Commissioner of Taxation (N.S.W.) - - - -	225
McCullin <i>v.</i> Crawford - - - -	186	Purcell, Deputy Federal Commissioner of Taxation <i>v.</i> - - - -	464
Menary, Alexander <i>v.</i> - - - -	371	Q	
Minister for Customs <i>v.</i> Australasian Films Ltd. - - - -	195	Queensland and Commissioner of Income Tax (Qd.), Commonwealth and Attorney-General (Cth.) <i>v.</i> - - - -	1
Municipal Tramways Trust, Edwards <i>v.</i> - - - -	129	R	
Murray <i>v.</i> Federal Commissioner of Taxation - - - -	134	R. <i>v.</i> Australasian Films Ltd. - - - -	195
N		— <i>v.</i> Commonwealth Court of Conciliation and Arbitration; <i>Ex parte</i> North Melbourne Electric Tramways and Lighting Co. Ltd. - - - -	106
Navigation and Judiciary Acts, <i>In re</i> - - - -	257	— <i>v.</i> Hibble; <i>Ex parte</i> Broken Hill Proprietary Co. Ltd. - - - -	290
Newcastle and Hunter River Steamship Co. Ltd. <i>v.</i> Attorney-General (Cth.) - - - -	357	—, Stewart <i>v.</i> - - - -	234
Newman, Commissioner of Taxation (W.A.) <i>v.</i> - - - -	484	—, Westralian Powell Wood Process Ltd. <i>v.</i> - - - -	458
Niesmann <i>v.</i> Collingridge - - - -	177	Ramacioti <i>v.</i> Federal Commissioner of Taxation - - - -	49
Nilsson, Buhlmann <i>v.</i> - - - -	417	Registrar of Probates (S.A.) <i>v.</i> Angas - - - -	477
North Melbourne Electric Tramways and Lighting Co. Ltd., <i>Ex parte</i> - - - -	106	Roach (E. W.) & J. B. Milton Proprietary Ltd., Carter <i>v.</i> - - - -	515
Nunawading Shire <i>v.</i> Adult Deaf and Dumb Society of Victoria	98		
O			
Official Assignee <i>v.</i> Goldstein - - - -	377		
Osborne <i>v.</i> Federal Commissioner of Taxation - - - -	169		

	PAGE	T	PAGE
Robinson, Alexander Stewart & Sons Ltd. <i>v.</i> [No. 1] - -	55	Taxation Commissioner. <i>See</i> Commissioner of Taxation.	
———, ——— <i>v.</i> [No. 2] - -	325	Taxes Commissioner. <i>See</i> Commissioner of Taxes.	
Roche <i>v.</i> Kronheimer - -	329	Turnbull's Assignee <i>v.</i> Goldstein	377
Ryan <i>v.</i> Davies Bros. Ltd. - -	527		
S		U	
S. Bennett Ltd., Wilkinson <i>v.</i> -	283	Union Steamship Co. of New Zealand Ltd. <i>v.</i> Federal Commissioner of Taxation - -	84
Scarlett & Co., Lennon <i>v.</i> - -	499		
Stamp Duties Commissioner. <i>See</i> Commissioner of Stamp Duties.		V	
Stang, James Clark & Co. <i>v.</i> -	113	Vegetable Creek Tin Mining Co. No Liability <i>v.</i> Commissioner of Stamp Duties (N.S.W.) -	414
State of Queensland, Commonwealth <i>v.</i> - - - -	1	Victoria, Daly <i>v.</i> - - - -	491
State of Victoria, Daly <i>v.</i> - -	491	W	
Stewart <i>v.</i> The King - - - -	234	Watkins <i>v.</i> Combes - - - -	317
Stewart (Alexander) & Sons Ltd. <i>v.</i> Robinson [No. 1] - -	55	Westralian Powell Wood Process Ltd. <i>v.</i> The Crown - - - -	458
——— <i>v.</i> —— [No. 2] - -	325	Whitfeld <i>v.</i> De Lauret & Co. Ltd.	71
Studebaker Corporation of Australasia Ltd. <i>v.</i> Commissioner of Taxation (N.S.W.) - -	225	Wilkinson <i>v.</i> S. Bennett Ltd. -	283
		Willis <i>v.</i> Burnes - - - -	511
		Wood <i>v.</i> Little - - - -	564

NAMES OF CASES UNREPORTED.

	PAGE		PAGE
Attorney-General (N.S.W.) (<i>Ex relatione</i> Magrath) <i>v.</i> Railway Commissioners (N.S.W.) -	602	Blackmore, Executor, Trustee and Agency Co. of South Australia <i>v.</i> - - - -	603
Australian Boot Trade Employees' Federation <i>v.</i> Vogt -	602	Bond, Murdoch <i>v.</i> - - - -	604
Barnett <i>v.</i> Beswicke - - - -	602	Bongiorno and Costa, Tipple <i>v.</i> -	604
Bayne <i>v.</i> Hall - - - -	602	Boulter <i>v.</i> Jocheim - - - -	602
Beswicke, Barnett <i>v.</i> - - - -	602	Branscombe <i>v.</i> The King - -	602
		Carter, Piper <i>v.</i> - - - -	604

	PAGE		PAGE
Commercial Bank of Australia		McWilliams <i>v.</i> Fullerton -	603
Ltd. <i>v.</i> Whinfield - - -	603	_____ <i>v.</i> Sherwin - - -	603
Davies and McGibbon, Ockerby		Mills, Khan <i>v.</i> - - -	603
<i>v.</i> - - - - -	604	Murdoch <i>v.</i> Bond - - -	604
Doyle, Stow <i>v.</i> - - -	604	Ockerby <i>v.</i> Davies and McGibbon	604
Dulhunty <i>v.</i> Lang - - -	603	Parke, Scarlett <i>v.</i> - - -	604
Executor, Trustee and Agency		Pearce, <i>In re</i> - - -	604
Co. of South Australia <i>v.</i>		Peden, R. <i>v.</i> - - -	604
Blackmore - - - - -	603	Piper <i>v.</i> Carter - - -	604
Federated Hotel &c Union.		R., Branscombe <i>v.</i> - - -	602
Strahan <i>v.</i> - - - - -	604	— <i>v.</i> Linehan - - -	604
Fullerton, McWilliams <i>v.</i> - -	603	—, McCulloch <i>v.</i> - - -	603
Gordon <i>v.</i> Gordon - - -	603	—, McDonald <i>v.</i> - - -	603
Hall, Bayne <i>v.</i> - - - - -	602	— <i>v.</i> Peden - - - - -	604
— Hooker <i>v.</i> - - - - -	603	Railway Commissioners (N.S.W.),	
Hooker <i>v.</i> Hall - - - - -	603	Attorney-General (N.S.W.) <i>v.</i>	602
Jocheim, Boulter <i>v.</i> - - -	602	Scarlett <i>v.</i> Parke - - -	604
Khan <i>v.</i> Mills - - - - -	603	Sherwin, McWilliams <i>v.</i> - -	603
Lang, Dulhunty <i>v.</i> - - - - -	603	Stow <i>v.</i> Doyle - - - - -	604
Linehan, R. <i>v.</i> - - - - -	604	Strahan <i>v.</i> Federated Hotel &c.	
McCulloch <i>v.</i> The King - - -	603	Union - - - - -	604
McDonald <i>v.</i> The King - - -	603	Tipple <i>v.</i> Bongiorno and Costa -	604
McGibbon and Davies, Ockerby		Vogt, Australian Boot Trade	
<i>v.</i> - - - - -	604	Employees' Federation <i>v.</i> -	602
		Whinfield, Commercial Bank of	
		Australia Ltd. <i>v.</i> - - -	603

Melbourne :
Harston, Partridge & Co., Printers,
152-154 Little Collins Street.