2008-2009

THE

FEDERAL COURT REPORTS

THE AUTHORISED REPORTS OF DECISIONS OF THE FEDERAL COURT OF AUSTRALIA

> editor VICTOR KLINE

> > Barrister-at-Law

CONSULTING EDITOR DAVID CATTERNS QC

VOLUME 173

LAWBOOK CO.

2009

SENIOR REPORTERS

DAVID ASH VICTOR KLINE RODEN PRITCHARD STEPHEN REBOKOFF SARAH SOMERSET ALEXIS WALLACE

REPORTERS

PAUL ARGENT TAMARA BOONE CLARE D'ARCY ROBERT MULLINS SAM URE

PRODUCTION EDITOR

LINDA PEARSON

THOMSON REUTERS

© 2009 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited ABN 64 058 914 668

Lawbook Co.

Published in Sydney

Printed by Ligare Pty Ltd, Riverwood, NSW

ISSN 0813-7803

FEDERAL COURT OF AUSTRALIA

CHIEF JUSTICE

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL ERIC JOHN BLACK, AC

JUDGES

THE HONOURABLE JEFFREY ERNEST JOHN SPENDER THE HONOURABLE PETER ROSS AWDRY GRAY THE HONOURABLE DONNELL MICHAEL RYAN THE HONOURABLE ROBERT SHENTON FRENCH (resigned, 1 September 2008) THE HONOURABLE TERENCE JOHN HIGGINS, AO THE HONOURABLE PETER CADDEN HEEREY (retired, 16 February 2009) THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL FRANCIS MOORE THE HONOURABLE CATHERINE MARGARET BRANSON (resigned, 13 October 2008) THE HONOURABLE KEVIN EDMUND LINDGREN THE HONOURABLE BRIAN JOHN MICHAEL TAMBERLIN (retired, 30 March 2009) THE HONOURABLE RONALD SACKVILLE (resigned, 25 August 2008) THE HONOURABLE PAUL DESMOND FINN THE HONOURABLE ROSS ALAN SUNDBERG THE HONOURABLE SHANE RAYMOND MARSHALL THE HONOURABLE ANTHONY MAX NORTH THE HONOURABLE JOHN RONALD MANSFIELD THE HONOURABLE ALAN HENRY GOLDBERG, AO THE HONOURABLE ARTHUR ROBERT EMMETT THE HONOURABLE RAYMOND ANTONY FINKELSTEIN THE HONOURABLE GEOFFREY MICHAEL GIUDICE THE HONOURABLE MARK SAMUEL WEINBERG (resigned, 19 July 2008) THE HONOURABLE JOHN ALFRED DOWSETT THE HONOURABLE SUSAN CORALIE KENNY

THE HONOURABLE ROGER VINCENT GYLES, AO (retired, 22 August 2008) THE HONOURABLE MARGARET ACKARY STONE THE HONOURABLE JAMES LESLIE BAIN ALLSOP (resigned, 2 June 2008) THE HONOURABLE GARRY KEITH DOWNES, AM THE HONOURABLE PETER MICHAEL JACOBSON THE HONOURABLE ANNABELLE CLAIRE BENNETT. AO THE HONOURABLE BRUCE THOMAS LANDER THE HONOURABLE ANTHONY NICHOLAS SIOPIS THE HONOURABLE RICHARD FRANCIS EDMONDS THE HONOURABLE PETER ROSS GRAHAM THE HONOURABLE ANDREW PETER GREENWOOD THE HONOURABLE STEVEN DAVID RARES THE HONOURABLE BERNA COLLIER THE HONOURABLE DENNIS ANTILL COWDROY, OAM THE HONOURABLE ANTHONY JAMES BESANKO THE HONOURABLE CHRISTOPHER NEIL JESSUP THE HONOURABLE RICHARD ROSS SINCLAIR TRACEY, RFD THE HONOURABLE JOHN ERIC MIDDLETON THE HONOURABLE ROBERT JOHN BUCHANAN THE HONOURABLE JOHN GILMOUR THE HONOURABLE MICHELLE MARJORIE GORDON THE HONOURABLE JOHN ALEXANDER LOGAN, RFD THE HONOURABLE GEOFFREY ALAN FLICK THE HONOURABLE NEIL WALTER MCKERRACHER THE HONOURABLE JOHN EDWARD REEVES THE HONOURABLE NYE PERRAM THE HONOURABLE JAYNE MARGARET JAGOT THE HONOURABLE LINDSAY GRAEME FOSTER