

2010  
WESTERN  
AUSTRALIAN  
REPORTS

INCORPORATING WESTERN AUSTRALIAN LAW REPORTS

**The Authorised Law Reports of the  
SUPREME COURT OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA**

EDITOR  
**SAM VANDONGEN SC**

CONSULTING EDITOR  
**JOSHUA THOMSON**

VOLUME 41

LAWBOOK CO.

2012

**REPORTERS**

PETER CLAY  
HOLLIS DUFOUR  
CATHERINE GARDE  
CAMILLE GOUCKE  
HENRY JACKSON  
STUART PACKHAM  
ANTHONY PAPAMATHEOS  
SHANE GEOFFREY STEWART  
CLARA WREN  
WILLIAM YOO

**PRODUCTION EDITOR**

MYUNG COLE

© State of Western Australia (2012)

This publication is copyright. Except as permitted under the *Copyright Act 1968*, no part of this publication may be reproduced or communicated by any process without the prior written permission of the Attorney General of Western Australia.



**THOMSON REUTERS**

2012 Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited

ABN 64 058 914 668

Lawbook Co.

Published in Sydney

ISSN 0083-8764

SUPREME COURT OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA

**Chief Justice**

THE HONOURABLE WAYNE STEWART MARTIN

COURT OF APPEAL

**President**

THE HONOURABLE CARMEL JOY McLURE

**Judges**

THE HONOURABLE CHRISTOPHER JAMES LONSDALE PULLIN

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL JOHN BUSS

THE HONOURABLE DAVID WALLACE NEWNES

THE HONOURABLE GRAEME HAROLD MURPHY

(appointed a Justice of Appeal, 3 August 2010)

THE HONOURABLE ROBERT ANTHONY MAZZA

(appointed a Justice of Appeal, 16 December 2011)

GENERAL DIVISION

**Judges**

THE HONOURABLE MICHAEL JOHN MURRAY

(retired, 15 January 2012)

THE HONOURABLE JOHN RODERICK McKECHNIE

THE HONOURABLE ERIC MICHAEL HEENAN

THE HONOURABLE NARELLE JOHNSON

THE HONOURABLE RENE LUCIEN LE MIERE

THE HONOURABLE CAROLYN FRANCES JENKINS

THE HONOURABLE RALPH LLOYD SIMMONDS

THE HONOURABLE ANDREW ROBERT BEECH

THE HONOURABLE JOHN ANTHONY CHANEY

THE HONOURABLE KENNETH JAMES MARTIN

THE HONOURABLE STEPHEN DAVID HALL

THE HONOURABLE EDWIN MICHAEL CORBOY

(appointed, 16 April 2010)

THE HONOURABLE JANINE PRITCHARD

(appointed, 11 June 2010)

THE HONOURABLE JEREMY DAVID ALLANSON

(appointed, 9 August 2010)

THE HONOURABLE JAMES JOSHUA EDELMAN  
(appointed, 25 July 2011)

**Master**

CRAIG WILLIAM SANDERSON

**EDITORIAL COMMITTEE**

**Chairman**

THE HONOURABLE KENNETH JAMES MARTIN

**Editor**

SAM VANDONGEN SC

**Members**

C L ZELESTIS, QC  
CG COLVIN SC

**Corrigendum**

**41 WAR 353:** Please note: “Murphy JA” should be replaced with “Murphy J” throughout the judgment.